



Technical Assistance Report

Project Number: 46210-001
Research and Development Technical Assistance (RDТА)
October 2012

Selected Evaluation Studies for 2012, Phase 2

ABBREVIATIONS

| | | |
|----------|---|--|
| ADB | – | Asian Development Bank |
| DEC | – | Development Effectiveness Committee |
| DMC | – | developing member country |
| EAP | – | evaluation approach paper |
| GACAP II | – | Second Governance and Anticorruption Action Plan |
| IED | – | Independent Evaluation Department |
| SES | – | special evaluation study |
| TA | – | technical assistance |

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE CLASSIFICATION

| | | |
|---------------------------------|---|---|
| Type | – | Research and development technical assistance (RDTA) |
| Targeting Classification | – | General intervention |
| Sector | – | Multisector |
| Themes | – | Economic growth , environmental sustainability, governance, private sector development |

NOTE

In this report, "\$" refers to US dollars.

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Director General | V. Thomas, Independent Evaluation Department (IED) |
| Team leader | J. G. Tubadeza, Evaluation Specialist (Operations Coordination), IED |
| Team members | L. Calderon, Evaluation Assistant, IED R. Lumin, Senior Evaluation Officer, IED |

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

I. INTRODUCTION

1. Since 1997, the Independent Evaluation Department (IED) and its predecessors, the Operations Evaluation Department and the Operations Evaluation Office, have administered umbrella or facility-type technical assistance (TA) projects to support a yearly Asian Development Bank (ADB) program of high-level evaluations involving multiple countries, sectors, and themes.¹ The first of the two research and development TA projects of this kind planned for 2012 was approved in August 2012.² It covered select evaluations from IED's derived program from operations (for example, country and regional evaluations and sector assessments) and the knowledge program from its Board-approved 2012–2014 work program.³ The TA for Selected Evaluation Studies for 2012, Phase 2 is the second IED research and development TA project for 2012.⁴ It will support a further round of evaluation studies from the same program cycle comprising three special evaluation studies in IED's 2013 work program that will assess ADB's performance in climate change management, enhancing good governance, and promoting inclusive growth.⁵

II. ISSUES

2. For Asia and the Pacific to sustain recent achievements in economic growth and poverty reduction, the region must continue to address (i) development gaps within and between countries in the region, including growing disparities between rural and urban areas and coastal and inland regions; (ii) inequitable access to new technology, education, infrastructure, and investment; and (iii) the impacts of climate change, such as drought, floods, and threats to food security. Growth must be inclusive and environmentally sustainable if it is to remain viable over the long term. Under Strategy 2020 adopted in 2008, ADB supports three complementary development agendas: inclusive economic growth, environmentally sustainable growth, and regional integration.⁶ ADB has designated governance as a key driver of change in implementing Strategy 2020.

3. The Strategy 2020 results framework and ADB's annual review of its performance against it have put development effectiveness at the core of ADB operations.⁷ This TA will help the IED provide assessments and feedback on the effectiveness of ADB operations in pursuing the priorities and targets of Strategy 2020 in three important areas.

4. **Promoting inclusive economic growth.** By promoting inclusive growth, ADB aims to stem rising inequality and reduce poverty in the region by ensuring that opportunities and benefits of sustained economic growth are accessed equitably by all segments of the population in its developing member countries (DMCs). Strategy 2020 shifted ADB to the inclusive growth development approach from a pro-poor growth strategy that had guided its operations since

¹ High-level evaluations include major evaluations such as special, real-time, and impact evaluations; evaluation knowledge studies; and country and regional evaluations.

² ADB. 2012. *Technical Assistance for Selected Evaluation Studies for 2012, Phase 1*. Manila (TA 8134-REG, \$750,000, approved on 10 August).

³ The 2012–2014 work program was discussed and endorsed by the ADB Board's Development Effectiveness Committee on 29 September 2011 and approved by the ADB Board of Directors on 7 December 2011. <http://www.adb.org/site/evaluation/ied/work-program>

⁴ The TA first appeared in the business opportunities section of ADB's website on 15 August 2012.

⁵ All three special evaluations are 2013 deliverables in the Board-approved 2012–2014 work program. Their priority as firm 2013 deliverables has been reaffirmed in the 2013–2015 work program exercise that was endorsed by the Development Effectiveness Committee on 10 October 2012, for Board approval in December 2012.

⁶ ADB. 2008. *Strategy 2020: The Long-Term Strategic Framework of the Asian Development Bank, 2008–2020*. Manila. <http://www.adb.org/documents/strategy-2020-working-asia-and-pacific-free-poverty>

⁷ ADB. 2012. *Development Effectiveness Review 2011 Report*. April. Manila. <http://www.adb.org/documents/development-effectiveness-review-2011-report>

1999.⁸ The shift was intended to increase the size and improve the distribution of economic benefits through sustained growth, human capital development, and the provision of safety nets. The evaluation under this TA will assess the relevance and effectiveness of the preliminary outcomes of Strategy 2020's inclusive growth agenda. It will also examine how the transition of the strategic focus from pro-poor to inclusive economic growth has influenced ADB's operations as it continues to pursue its mission of poverty reduction.

5. **Enhancing good governance.** ADB has emphasized good governance as a key driver of change in pursuit of its priorities under Strategy 2020. The strategic framework for ADB's governance and anticorruption work is provided by its governance and anticorruption policies and the Second Governance and Anticorruption Action Plan (GACAP II) adopted in 2005.⁹ While ADB's R-paper on Governance: Sound Development Management sets a broad agenda, GACAP II takes a risk-based approach and seeks to enable ADB and its DMCs to design and deliver better quality projects through improvements in (i) country partnership strategies for social and economic development; (ii) program and project-level design; (iii) program and project-level administration and management; and (iv) institutional level skills, capacities, and operational practices.¹⁰ The study will assess the relevance and effectiveness of ADB's governance policy and operations over time. This will include an evaluation of GACAP II areas of emphasis (improving public financial management and procurement and combating corruption).

6. **Climate proofing the development process.** Based on a wide consensus in the international scientific community, it has become increasingly clear that climate change mitigation actions need to be intensified several-fold to preempt disastrous climate change and that mitigation activities will need to be augmented by adaptation.¹¹ In response, ADB has sought to mainstream climate change management in its operations. In addition to activities to mitigate climate change it initiated in 2005–2006 (with the launch of the Energy Efficiency Initiative and Carbon Market Initiative), ADB has intensified its adaptation interventions by instituting region-wide climate change implementation plans in each of its five regions of operation. The study will evaluate ADB's completed and ongoing climate change mitigation and adaptation programs.

III. THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

A. Impact and Outcome

7. The impact of the TA will be improved development effectiveness of ADB operations, policies, strategies, and business processes. Its expected outcome will be increased use of evaluation findings, lessons, and recommendations by the ADB Board of Directors and the Board's Development Effectiveness Committee in particular, and by ADB Management. The design and monitoring framework is in Appendix 1.

⁸ ADB. 2001. *Moving the Poverty Reduction Agenda Forward in the Asia and the Pacific: The Long-term Strategic Framework of the Asian Development Bank, 2001–2015*. Manila. <http://www2.adb.org/documents/policies/ltsf/default.asp>

⁹ GACAP II outlines a comprehensive risk-based approach to managing governance and fighting corruption. It refocused efforts to achieve results in three priority areas in the sectors where ADB operates: improving public financial management, strengthening procurement systems, and combating corruption. (<http://www.adb.org/themes/governance/action-plan>)

¹⁰ ADB. 1995. Doc. R151-95. *Governance: Sound Development Management*. August. Manila

¹¹ Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. 2007. *Climate Change 2007, the Fourth Assessment Report of the United Nations Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change*. Geneva

B. Methodology and Key Activities

8. The TA will support three special evaluation studies (SEs) that will assess ADB's operations in (i) climate change management, (ii) enhancing good governance, and (iii) promoting inclusive growth. It will also support the dissemination of evaluation knowledge products. The evaluation process will begin with the preparation by an evaluation study team of a concept paper, including consultant terms of reference.¹² After approval of the concept by the director general of the IED, an evaluation approach paper (EAP) will be drafted to describe each study and its coverage, including the countries selected for case studies and the proposed dissemination plan for each study.¹³ All major IED evaluations are intended to provide inputs for major policy and operational decisions by ADB's Board and Management. IED will schedule the studies to meet the timeline of these decisions.¹⁴ In this particular case, the three SEs will serve as key inputs for Management review of Strategy 2020 planned for 2015 and IED's validation of Management's review (also planned for 2015). Once completed, major evaluation reports will be circulated and discussed by the Development Effectiveness Committee.

9. **Inclusive growth: What is it? Why does it matter?** This SE will seek to (i) present a general understanding of inclusive growth and evidence of where and how it has been achieved across DMCs, (ii) assess ADB's support for inclusive growth in its DMCs, (iii) identify lessons learned from ADB's support to promote inclusive growth in various contexts; and (iv) provide guidance for ADB's future work in inclusive growth.¹⁵ The study will comprise background papers on inclusive growth and relevant interventions; a portfolio review of completed and ongoing projects; a review of relevant sector work; and around four in-depth country case studies, with Bangladesh, Indonesia, the Philippines, and Sri Lanka now tentative candidates for these undertakings. The SE findings will inform future ADB work and be used to assess the relevance and effectiveness of the preliminary outcomes of Strategy 2020's inclusive growth agenda.

10. **Enhancing good governance in ADB's public sector operations.** The study will cover four areas.¹⁶ First, it will review ADB's portfolio and performance.¹⁷ Secondly, desk studies supported by country case studies will be used to assess ADB support to sector reforms. Thirdly, an institutional phase will (i) study ADB's governance policy and subsequent action plans, with a focus on the current GACAP II period; and (ii) assess the relevance of ADB's governance policy and approach going forward. Finally, the SE will include a literature review and preparation of background papers on new approaches to governance and on public sector management, as well as the nexus between public and private sector involvement, particularly in utility sector management.

¹² Consultant recruitment may begin after the concept note is reviewed and endorsed by the IED leadership team, which includes the IED director general.

¹³ The draft EAP is being reviewed by peers and discussed in an IED-wide meeting chaired by the IED director general. The final version will take into account comments on all aspects of the evaluation approach.

¹⁴ IED has introduced formal interdepartmental consultation before final approval of an EAP by the IED director general. The IED will consider comments from ADB to the extent possible and, if necessary, make changes to the EAP and publish this in its website (<http://www.adb.org/site/evaluation/ongoing-evaluations>).

¹⁵ The proposed study will cover the period from 2000 to 2011.

¹⁶ This SE is a requirement under the Asian Development Fund XI implementation plan.

¹⁷ This will include a review of trends in the structure and performance of ADB's governance and public sector management portfolio since the Board approved governance policy in 1995 (<http://www.adb.org/documents/promoting-good-governance-adbs-medium-term-agenda-and-action-plan>). The study will also examine ADB support to sector governance reform, including reform in the energy, water, telecommunications, and transport sectors. Special attention will be given to reform support, such as capacity building and institutional support, and performance of the portfolio. The SE will assess the relevance and effectiveness of GACAP II, including its risk assessment approach and the relevance to ADB of the new governance agenda, particularly in the areas of domestic accountability and transparency (<http://www.adb.org/themes/governance/overview>).

11. **ADB's support for climate change management.** The SES will focus on the following: (i) policy dialogue and TA to integrate mitigation and adaptation considerations and low-carbon development strategies; (ii) estimates of greenhouse gas emission reduction from energy sector projects supported by ADB; (iii) the establishment of priorities for expansion of energy infrastructure, and clean energy investments on the supply and demand sides; (iv) analysis of climate change vulnerabilities to adjust sector strategies and increase sector resilience; (v) climate proofing of infrastructure development projects; and (vi) attention to the needs of such vulnerable groups as the poor, women, and minorities. The SES will draw on the findings of other work on mitigation and attempt to evaluate adaptation interventions that address long-term climate change by transforming existing systems and practices.

12. **Dissemination of knowledge products.** To make its evaluation products more accessible and influential, the IED will continue to disclose, disseminate, and share evaluation feedback on performance and lessons. Using the SES results, it will prepare and publish syntheses, briefs, and occasional papers tailored to widen readership and provide continuous feedback on ADB's operations, strategies, and policies.

C. Cost and Financing

13. The TA is estimated to cost \$750,000, which will be financed on a grant basis by ADB's Technical Assistance Special Fund (TASF-IV). The cost estimates and financing plan are in Appendix 2.

D. Implementation Arrangements

14. ADB will be the executing agency for the TA. The IED will implement it and supervise all planned studies. The studies will require the services of 16 international consultants for about 24 person-months and 16 national consultants for about 25 person-months.¹⁸ The outline terms of reference for consulting requirements are in Appendix 3. More detailed terms of reference for each study will be developed for the EAP. ADB will engage consultants primarily on an individual basis in accordance with its Guidelines on the Use of Consultants (2010, as amended from time to time). The specific services required from consulting firms (e.g., surveys) will be considered during preparation of the EAP.

15. Disbursements under the TA will be made in accordance with ADB's *Technical Assistance Disbursement Handbook* (2010, as amended from time to time). Tracking of study progress will be recorded through internal monitoring sheets on key milestone events, mission back-to-office reports, and ad hoc presentations or consultations on evaluation study findings. The TA outputs will be disseminated in accordance with IED's evaluation policy, particularly with regard to public disclosure, dissemination, and lessons. The TA is scheduled to start 31 October 2012 and expected to end by 31 October 2014. Implementation arrangements will be flexible to accommodate alterations in IED's work program or changes in response to priorities under Strategy 2020 and assistance provided from Asian Development Fund X and XI. ADB will obtain a no-objection from the DMC government before starting any activity financed under this TA in the territory of that country.

¹⁸ The number of consultants and their inputs are indicative. Consultant requirements will be reviewed during the concept paper stage and finalized in the EAP.

IV. DECISION

16. The Director General, Independent Evaluation Department, acting under the authority delegated by the Board, has approved the provision of technical assistance not exceeding the equivalent of \$750,000 on a grant basis for Selected Evaluation Studies for 2012, Phase 2. This action is hereby reported to the Board.

DESIGN AND MONITORING FRAMEWORK

| Design Summary | Performance Targets and Indicators with Baselines | Data Sources and Reporting Mechanisms | Assumptions and Risks |
|---|---|---|--|
| Impact Improved development effectiveness of ADB operations, policies, strategies, and business processes | Rating of <i>satisfactory</i> for quality-at-entry of projects and programs sustained (by 2018) Cumulative overall success rate of country assistance programs improves every year from the 3-year period average of 69% during 2009–2011 (by 2018) | Biannual review of quality-at-entry Performance ratings of country assistance programs from self-evaluation (CPS final review reports) and independent evaluation (country assistance program evaluations and validations of CPS final review reports) | Assumptions ADB Management continues to act on lessons and recommendations from IED evaluation reports. IED evaluation lessons and recommendations continue to be relevant and actionable. |
| Outcome Increased use of evaluation findings, lessons, and recommendations by the ADB Board of Directors, the Board's Development Effectiveness Committee, and ADB Management | Rate of adoption of recommendations by ADB Management improves every year from a 3-year average of 73% during 2009–2011 (by 2015) ADB Management accepts no fewer than 85% of IED recommendations every year (by 2015) Evidence of improvement in the use of IED findings as inputs to and an influence on the designs of new ADB operations, country and sector strategies, and policies (by 2015) Baseline: Rates of favorable responses in 2011 were 77% for country strategies, 73% for sector programs, 73% for lending operations, and 63% for non-lending operations. | Management Action Record System ADB Management response IED client perception survey on evaluation quality satisfaction | Assumptions ADB Management agrees with evaluation findings and to act on lessons and recommendations. Evaluation recommendations remain relevant, suitable, and realistic. The timeline of major policy and operational decisions by ADB allow IED to complete its evaluation. |
| Outputs Useful lessons and recommendations from completed evaluation reports | At least 85% of evaluations programmed under the TA are completed as planned. No major quality issues are raised on the evaluations in the DEC meetings or DEC annual report by 2014. Client perception of IED reports as evidence-based and drawn from in-depth analyses improves to 75% by 2015 Baseline: Favorable responses in 2011: evidence-based—72%, and | IED annual work program Summary of DEC discussions Annual report of the DEC IED client perception survey on evaluation quality satisfaction | Assumptions No significant attrition of IED staff occurs. Consultants with required expertise are available to join the evaluation teams. Each evaluation team has access to all required data (e.g., baseline data and secondary data). |

| Design Summary | Performance Targets and Indicators with Baselines | Data Sources and Reporting Mechanisms | Assumptions and Risks |
|---|--|--|--------------------------------|
| | based on in-depth analyses—68% | | |
| Activities with Milestones 1. Special evaluation study — promoting inclusive growth 1.1 IED completes evaluation approach paper by January 2013 1.2 IED director general approves final draft of evaluation report by October 2013 1.3 DEC discusses the completed evaluation study by December 2013 2. Special evaluation study — good governance in public sector operations 2.1 IED completes evaluation approach paper by December 2012 2.2 IED director general approves final draft of evaluation report by December 2013 2.3 DEC discusses the completed evaluation study by first quarter 2014 3. Special evaluation study — climate change management 3.1 IED completes evaluation approach paper by December 2012 3.2 IED director general approves final draft of evaluation report by October 2013 3.3 DEC discusses the completed evaluation study by first quarter 2014 4. Proactive dissemination of knowledge products including implementation of dissemination plans (2013–2014). | | | Inputs ADB \$750,000 |

ADB = Asian Development Bank, CPS = country partnership strategy, DEC = Development Effectiveness Committee, IED = Independent Evaluation Department, SES = special evaluation study.

Source: Independent Evaluation Department.

COST ESTIMATES AND FINANCING PLAN
(\$'000)

| Item | Total Cost |
|--|---------------|
| Asian Development Bank Financing^a | |
| 1. Consultants | |
| a. Remuneration and per diem | |
| i. International consultants | 414.00 |
| ii. National consultants | 86.00 |
| b. International and local travel | 120.00 |
| c. Reports and communications | 10.00 |
| 2. Surveys | 30.00 |
| 3. Workshops, training, seminars, and conferences ^b | 20.00 |
| 4. Miscellaneous administration and support costs | 10.00 |
| 5. Contingencies | 60.00 |
| Total | 750.00 |

^a Financed by the Asian Development Bank's Technical Assistance Special Fund (TASF-IV).

^b Seminars and workshops are not technical assistance outputs but are held either to acquire inputs for draft reports or to disseminate results. This category also includes support to disseminate the Independent Evaluation Department's knowledge product and services through publications or other channels.

Source: Asian Development Bank estimates.

OUTLINE TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR CONSULTANTS

1. The three special evaluation studies (SEs) will require a total of 16 international consultants for about 24 person-months and 16 national consultants for about 25 person-months.¹

A. Special Evaluation Study on Promoting Inclusive Growth: What is it? Why does it matter? (9 person-months international and 7 person-months national).

2. The SES will require the services of nine international consultants: three development economists (including a lead consultant), four country economists, and two external reviewers. The team of international experts will be supported by five national consultants, including two at ADB headquarters and three for in-country assignments. The special evaluation will comprise around 2–4 background papers on inclusive growth and relevant interventions, a portfolio review of completed and ongoing projects, a review of relevant sector work, and about four in-depth case studies in selected countries (possibly Bangladesh, Indonesia, the Philippines, and Sri Lanka.) Findings from the study will be presented at a final workshop.

3. **International consultants.** The team leader will be a development economist (3 person-months) and will consolidate the study report with expert assistance from the consultant team, using the findings of background studies and country case studies. Two more development economists (total of 1.5 person-months) will be engaged to (i) critically review inclusive growth, using previous studies on inclusive growth available within and outside of ADB; and (ii) produce two background papers on the relationships of labor and safety nets to inclusive growth. Four country economists (total of 4 person-months) will carry out the in-depth country case studies. Two external reviewers (total of 0.5 person-months) will be engaged to peer review the draft evaluation report for quality assurance. Overall, the consultant team will assess ADB's approach to inclusive economic growth by (i) presenting a general understanding of inclusive growth and evidence what and where it has been achieved across ADB's developing member countries (DMCs); (ii) assessing ADB's support for inclusive growth in its DMCs; (iii) identifying lessons from ADB's support in promoting inclusive growth in various contexts; (iv) providing guidance for ADB's future work in inclusive growth; and (v) contributing useful lessons and recommendations, including pointers and guidance for improving daily routine operations (from design through business processing to approval) and policy making.²

4. During field visits to the case study countries, the consultants will conduct stakeholder surveys and interview those knowledgeable and informed on the outcome and impact of ADB assistance and discuss sector development issues and concerns with executing agencies and other government and nongovernment entities, as appropriate.

5. **National consultants.** Under the supervision of the SES team leader, national evaluation consultants based at ADB headquarters (total of 4 person-months) will carry out (i) a desk review of related ADB policies and strategies (e.g., secondary data collection); and (ii) a portfolio analysis of loans, grants, dealing with inclusive growth (e.g., review project documents.)

¹ Estimates of consultant requirements are tentative. These will be reviewed at the concept paper stage and finalized in the evaluation approach paper.

² The proposed study will cover 2000–2011.

6. With attention to country and sector requirements, in-country national consultants with previous exposure to sector development issues in the study country will be recruited for a total of 3 person-months to (i) present an overview of the relevance and implementation of ADB's strategy and interventions; (ii) assess and rate the achievement of project and program objectives and the delivery of the program in the context of promoting inclusive economic growth; (iii) comment on ADB's institutional positioning and performance in promoting inclusive economic growth; (iv) organize and facilitate focus group discussions, workshops, and meetings; and (v) identify important issues and lessons in promoting inclusive economic growth in the context of ADB's sector operations.

B. Special Evaluation Study on Enhancing Good Governance in ADB's Public Sector Operations (7 person-months international and 10 person-months national)

7. The SES will require the services of three international consultants. The international experts will be supported by two ADB headquarters-based national evaluation consultants and four in-country national consultants from the case study countries.³

8. **International consultants.** The SES evaluation team will require the services of two international consultants (total of 5 person-months) to undertake background papers as part of the literature review phase of the study. The literature review will include desk studies of sectors to identify the types of sector reforms supported by ADB and the type of support provided in DMCs, which will then be followed up for assessment by the country case studies.⁴ One literature review will look at new approaches to supporting governance, including that being taken by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development on transparency and accountability. A second desk study will look at public sector management and issues in public utility reform (i.e., the nexus between public and private participation, particularly in utility sector management.) A third international consultant (2 person-months) will assess the relevance and effectiveness of ADB's Second Governance and Anticorruption Action Plan, including its risk assessment approach generally and in its main areas of emphasis (e.g., improving project financial management and procurement and combating corruption). This consultant will also prepare an overview of all recent reviews conducted by ADB's Regional Sustainable Development Department. The consultant team will be expected to contribute useful lessons and recommendations from findings for the SES report, including pointers and guidance for improving daily routine operations (from design through business processing to approval) and policy making.

9. **National consultants.** National evaluation consultants based at ADB headquarters (total of 6 person-months) will undertake a portfolio review of ADB support for governance since 1995. The consultants will collect, collate, and analyze ADB project data in governance from 1995 to 2012. They will also carry out a desk review of performance. The evaluation study will also require in-country national consultants in each country (total of 4 person-months) to (i) present an overview of the relevance and implementation of ADB's strategy and interventions; (ii) assess and rate the achievement of project and program objectives and the delivery of the program in the context of enhancing good governance in sovereign operations; (iii) comment on

³ The SES is one of four IED evaluations for action under the Asian Development Fund XI implementation plan and is to be delivered in 2013.

⁴ The desk studies will identify the type of reforms that ADB supports and the objectives these reforms are meant to achieve. The studies will consider the significance of these reforms to fundamental change in the way sectors are managed. The desk studies will be supported by country case studies, particularly in considering the beneficial or negative effects of these reforms on people. One desk study will focus on public utilities (i.e., the nexus between public and private sector involvement or participation in public utilities, especially in managing these).

ADB's institutional positioning and performance in promoting good governance in its operations; (iv) organize and facilitate focus group discussions, workshops, and meetings; and (v) identify important issues and lessons in promoting good governance in ADB's sector operations.

C. Special Evaluation Study on ADB's Support for Climate Change Management (8 person-months international and 8 person-months national).

10. The SES will require the services of four international consultants: a development economist; two climate change specialists, including a clean energy specialist; and a peer reviewer. The team of international experts will be supported by an ADB headquarters-based national evaluation consultant and four in-country national consultants from each of the selected study countries.

11. **International consultants.** The four international consultants (total of 8 person-months) will help evaluate ongoing ADB's adaptation programs, including interventions that address long-term climate change impacts by transforming existing systems and practices and those that seek to address existing adaptation deficits or manage only incremental changes to climate vulnerability. The consultants will assess the relevance, responsiveness, effectiveness, sustainability, and impact of ADB support to climate change management, focusing on (i) policy dialogue and technical assistance to integrate mitigation considerations and low-carbon development strategies, (ii) greenhouse gas emission reduction from energy sector projects, and (iii) priorities for expanding energy infrastructure and clean energy investments.

12. During field visits to the selected study countries, the consultants will undertake key informant interviews and conduct stakeholder surveys on the outcome and impact of ADB support and discuss climate change-related issues and concerns with executing agencies and other government and nongovernment entities, as appropriate. The consultants will also help assess the validity of four dimensions of ADB's climate change-related development strategies in each study country: (i) policy dialogue to integrate adaptation considerations into development strategies; (ii) analysis of climate change vulnerabilities to adjust sector strategies and increase sector resilience; (iii) climate proofing of infrastructure development projects; and (iv) attention to the needs of such vulnerable groups as the poor, women, and minorities. The study will draw on applicable findings of other IED work on mitigation. The consultant team will contribute useful lessons and recommendations, including pointers and guidance for improving daily routine operations (from design through business processing to approval) and policy making.

13. **National consultants.** An ADB headquarters-based national consultant (3 person-months) will be recruited in Manila to help the SES evaluation team carry out desk studies, including data collection analyses and a review of project documents. The in-country national consultants (total of 5 person-months) will preferably have previous exposure to climate change-related development issues in the study country. They will be recruited to (i) present an overview of the relevance and implementation of ADB's climate change strategy and interventions; (ii) assess and rate the achievement of project and program objectives and the delivery of the program in support of climate change management; (iii) comment on ADB's institutional positioning and performance in climate change management in a sector; (iv) organize and facilitate focus group discussions, workshops, and meetings; and (v) identify important climate change-related issues and lessons in a sector's operations.