



Completion Report

Project Number: 47039-001
Technical Assistance Number: 8467
July 2017

Mongolia: Ulaanbaatar Urban Planning Improvement

This document is being disclosed to the public in accordance with ADB's Public Communications Policy 2011.

Asian Development Bank

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

TA Number, Country, and Name: TA 8467-MON: Ulaanbaatar Urban Planning Improvement		Amount Approved: \$1,500,000	
		Revised Amount: Not applicable	
Executing Agency: Municipality of Ulaanbaatar	Source of Funding: Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction	Amount Undisbursed: \$181,218	Amount Utilized: \$1,318,782
TA Approval Date: 1 October 2013	TA Signing Date: 13 December 2013	Fielding of First Consultants: 17 March 2014	TA Completion Date Original: 30 September 2015 Actual: 30 September 2016 Account Closing Date Original: 31 December 2015 Actual: 31 December 2016
<p>Description. Ulaanbaatar needed to build its capacity to better plan, regulate, and implement its urban development to overcome the long-term economic, social, and environmental challenges that the city is currently facing and to improve the people's quality of life. However, the technical capacity and institutional arrangements within the urban planning function of the municipality did not allow the city to achieve its development objectives, and did not respond to the urban development requirements of a rapidly growing city in a market-led economy. The government and the Asian Development Bank (ADB) identified capacity improvement in urban planning as a crucial step towards generating optimal development impact, ensuring real economic improvements, operational sustainability of the urban sector, and better urban governance.</p> <p>Expected Impact, Outcome, and Outputs. The expected impact of the capacity development technical assistance (TA) was improved living conditions in Ulaanbaatar. The expected outcome was stronger capacity of the Municipality of Ulaanbaatar (MUB) for urban planning. The objective of the TA was to strengthen Ulaanbaatar's development strategies and plans by building MUB's capacity and mechanisms in urban planning based on international standards. The expected outputs were (i) enhancement of technical skills for urban planning and development of master and local plans, (ii) strengthening of urban planning function with a more participatory process and efficient organizational arrangement, (iii) establishment of shared urban database, and (iv) upgrade of urban planning software.</p> <p>Delivery of Inputs and Conduct of Activities. The TA financed 91.5 person-months of consulting services: 30 person-months of international consultants, and 61.5 person-months of national consultants. Consulting services were engaged in accordance with ADB's Guidelines on the Use of Consultants (2013, as amended from time to time). The performance of the consultants was satisfactory. Workshops and working group meetings were well-attended and carried out in a participatory manner.^a All consulting activities were accomplished within the budget with no cost overruns. The TA was extended twice for a total of 12 months. The first extension, until 31 March 2016, was due to the delay in TA signing and engagement of the consulting firm. The second extension, until 30 September 2016, was to (i) provide additional time for the consultants to revise the final report; (ii) get the endorsement of the regulation for the use of shared urban database and delivery of related information technology (IT) equipment; and (iii) organize the international cities partnership forum. Monthly reports were submitted on a regular basis and continuous implementation supervision was conducted all throughout the TA implementation period. Minor implementation changes were approved, including (i) change in the procurement officer of equipment from MUB to ALMEC corporation, (ii) engagement of additional expert (housing finance specialist) as individual consultant, and (iii) replacement of international urban design specialist to international participatory planning specialist/project coordinator.</p> <p>The performance of MUB as the executing agency was satisfactory. TA findings were discussed with MUB, related ministries, key stakeholders, and communities during TA review missions and associated workshops. The performance of ADB was satisfactory. ADB closely managed the implementation of the TA, providing timely inputs and guidance to the TA team to ensure the good quality of consultants' activities, deliverables, and final report. ADB approved the final report on 30 September 2016. Missions fielded were (i) TA inception mission on 16–24 June 2014, (ii) TA review (interim) mission on 22 April–5 May 2016, and (iii) TA review (final) mission on 26–30 September 2016.</p> <p>Evaluation of Outputs and Achievement of Outcome. The TA outputs, which were endorsed by MUB and the government, are summarized below:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Output 1: Enhancement of technical skills for urban planning and development of master and local plans. Fifteen training sessions and 10 workshops (including 2 international workshops) were conducted. In total, around 770 persons from diverse institutions such as MUB, relevant government agencies, various municipal organizations linked to urban planning and administration, private business companies, academic circles, and community citizen groups or nongovernment organizations attended the trainings and workshops. More than 80 staff of Master Planning Agency of Capital City and Urban Planning, Architecture, and Design Institute of Ulaanbaatar City received training from September 2014 to September 2016 on geographic information system 			

(GIS); land valuation; socioeconomic development framework; land and housing; urban mobility; urban design; environment; disaster management; urban engineering; legal, institutional, and organizational issues; planning administration; green city; and urban growth management and zoning; among others. Among them, 19 received special training certificates for their excellent participation.

- **Output 2: Strengthening of urban planning function with a more participatory process and efficient organizational arrangement.** A roadmap to strengthen urban planning organization and functions, especially on increasing public participation and improving coordination from planning to implementation, has been proposed and detailed in the urban planning manual. Partnerships between Ulaanbaatar City and international cities have been developed by sharing urban issues and experiences, including an international partnership seminar in Ha Noi (Viet Nam) in June 2015 and in Calgary (Canada) in April 2016. A joint international seminar was also held in Ulaanbaatar City in September 2016 to consolidate international cities' experiences in urban planning and management, and to promote further city partnerships for technical cooperation with the cities of Calgary (Canada), Edmonton (Canada), Ha Noi (Viet Nam), Paris (France), and Yokohama (Japan). City-to-city working programs and exchanges between relevant municipal departments and urban institutes have been supported by the Future Cities Program. A cooperation memorandum of understanding was signed with Edmonton City on 16 February 2017 and Paris Region Urban Institute's partnership activities with MUB have been financed by the Future Cities Program. A draft urban planning manual (textbook for urban planning) was submitted on 30 September 2016. The manual was peer reviewed and completed in April 2017 and was officially delivered to the MUB on 19 May 2017.
- **Outputs 3 and 4: Establishment of shared urban database and upgrade of urban planning software.** These included (i) design of the shared urban database system and information sharing methodology; (ii) preparation of draft rules for shared urban database in MUB; and (iii) setting-up of computers and software, installation and configuration of server, data analysis and coding preparation of one-stop-shop function, and online training on the use of the shared urban database. Procedures were established to regulate actions for creating and maintaining the shared urban GIS database (from consolidated GIS databases operated by municipal administrative agencies), and in October 2016, MUB approved the guidelines for utilization of the shared database. The GIS software and equipment that were procured were handed-over to MUB after TA completion.

Overall Assessment and Rating. The TA is rated successful. Its design was timely and relevant, and has strong ownership from MUB. The TA was implemented efficiently, effectively, and within budget.

Major Lessons. Firstly, capacity development should take into consideration the negative impacts of change of staff due to national or municipal elections; and the design of the training program should be able to adjust or adapt accordingly to these circumstances. Secondly, on-the-job trainings are more appropriate and efficient than general training courses, as (i) general training courses keep staff away from their daily work often resulting to reluctance from supervisors to send staff for training; and (ii) on-the-job trainings focus on implementation of specific activities and has less impact on staff turnover. Lastly, strengthening of urban planning, organization, and functioning have been discussed and agreed in principle with MUB, but it will take a longer time than anticipated for it to materialize and be institutionalized.

Recommendations and Follow-Up Actions. Follow-up activities are still required to support the urban planning capacity in Ulaanbaatar. Ongoing or future ADB projects and programs will build on the TA outputs, and will continue urban planning capacity strengthening activities and institutional reforms started by the TA. For example, (i) through the cities partnership, established under the ADB Future Cities Program, MUB and Paris Region Urban Institute are establishing a knowledge platform to support the formation of urban planners and share international experiences in urban planning and urban development, (ii) *ger* area (peri-urban area) development programs^b are implementing specific urban planning tools to formulate local development plans for *ger* area subcenters upgrading and for affordable housing and green urban renewal.

^a Feedback on training content and delivery were systematically collected from the participants and were used to adjust further training sessions during the TA implementation.

^b ADB. 2013. *Report and Recommendation of the President to the Board of Directors: Proposed Multitranchise Financing Facility for Mongolia for Ulaanbaatar Urban Services and Ger Areas Development Investment Program*. Manila; ADB. 2015. *Project Preparatory Technical Assistance to Mongolia for Ulaanbaatar Affordable Housing and Urban Renewal Project*. Manila.