



Completion Report

PUBLIC

Project Number: 49050-001
Technical Assistance Number: 9223
August 2022

Pakistan: Provincial Strategy for Inclusive and Sustainable Urban Growth

This document is being disclosed to the public in accordance with ADB's Access to Information Policy.

Asian Development Bank

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

TA Number, Country, and Name: TA 9223-PAK: Provincial Strategy for Inclusive and Sustainable Urban Growth		Amount Approved: \$2,400,000.00	
		Revised Amount: \$2,238,419.14	
Executing Agency: Planning and Development Department (P&DD), Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Source of Funding: Technical Assistance Special Fund (\$0.24 million TASF-other sources) and Japan Fund for Prosperous and Resilient Asia and the Pacific (\$2.00 million)	Amount Undisbursed: \$480,774.10	Amount Used: \$1,757,645.04
TA Approval Date: 7 November 2016	TA Signing Date: 2 December 2016	TA Completion Date	
		Original Date: 31 December 2018	Latest Revised Date: 30 September 2021
		Financial Closing Date: 29 November 2021	Number of Extensions: 3
TA Type: Policy and advisory TA		TA Arrangement: Not applicable	

Description

The policy and advisory technical assistance (TA) aimed to assist the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) in adopting an integrated urban sector development approach with infrastructure investments, policy reform, and capacity development in the urban sector. ADB and the Government of Pakistan agreed to focus on the KP province because of the provincial government's strong political commitment to promoting integrated urban development and implementing policy and institutional reforms.

The scope of the TA was aligned with ADB's country partnership strategy, 2015–2019¹ for Pakistan and country operations business plan, 2016–2018,² that underscored the importance of greater equity, facilitation of inclusive jobs, and increased economic opportunities by supporting reforms that improve urban services and support the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals. The TA also considered the government's strategic priorities that focus on building economic competitiveness through accessible tourism development and local economic development along economic corridors of the province. Japan Fund for Prosperous and Resilient Asia and the Pacific (JFPR) and Technical Assistance Special Fund (TASF–other sources) contributed \$2.00 million and \$0.24 million, respectively.

Expected Impact, Outcome, and Outputs

The expected impact was aligned with a renewed focus on inclusive and sustainable urban development in provincial policies and allocations. The expected outcome was improved urban inclusivity, sustainability, and resilience in investment programming in KP province. The expected outputs included: (i) sector road map for inclusive and sustainable urban growth endorsed; (ii) Regional Development Plans (RDPs) prepared by provincial and local governments; (iii) institutional capacity for implementation agencies built; and (iv) lessons from pilots on accredited trainings and municipal business planning mainstreamed with the urban sector.

¹ ADB. 2015. [Country Partnership Strategy: Pakistan, 2015–2019](#). Manila.

² ADB. 2015. [Country Operations Business Plan: Pakistan, 2016–2018](#). Manila.

Implementation Arrangements

The TA was implemented over 58 months by a multidisciplinary team at ADB, including the Urban Development and Water Division of the Central and West Asia Department (CWUW) as the focal point of the TA, with support from the Urban Sector Group, Water Sector Group, and Gender Thematic Group of the Sustainable Development and Climate Change Department (SDCC) and the Pakistan Resident Mission (PRM). The executing agency was the Planning and Development Department (P&DD). The implementing agencies included the P&DD's Urban Policy Unit, the P&DD's Economic Section, and the Local Government, Elections and Rural Development Department (the Local Government). A consortium of two firms was engaged in February 2018 to provide consulting services for the development of sector roadmap (output 1), RDPs (output 2), and institutional capacity development (output 3). ADB also engaged three individual national consultants to support activities for institutional capacity development (output 3), for a total of 11.6 person-months. A consulting firm was engaged using single-source selection in July 2017 to prepare the municipal business plan (output 4). The first mission to Pakistan was fielded in April 2018 following mobilization of the project team. The consultant's team undertook consultations with stakeholders in the five cities of Abbottabad, Kohat, Mardan, Mingora, and Peshawar. The consultants also carried out desk reviews for collecting data and information.

The original implementation period for the TA was from December 2016 to December 2018. A minor change in scope and extension of TA completion date was processed in December 2018 to prepare additional RDPs instead of three knowledge products,³ and to extend the TA completion date from 31 December 2018 to 31 December 2019, with no increase in TA amount. In May 2019, a request for additional TA category and reallocation of funds under the TASF was processed to add a new line category for "seminars, workshops, and conferences", with the corresponding reallocation, in order to finance (i) the participation of KP municipal operators for the Resilience Accelerator Workshop hosted by the Urban Climate Change Resilience Trust Fund (UCCRTF), and (ii) the Water Operations Training by Maynilad Water Academy. A second extension of the TA completion date from 31 December 2019 to 31 December 2020 was processed in December 2019 to complete the RDPs covering the two new cities of Kohat and Mingora.⁴ A third extension of the TA completion date from 31 December 2020 to 30 September 2021 was approved in December 2020 due to delays brought on by the coronavirus disease (COVID-19) pandemic, for a cumulative extension of 33 months to complete and launch the RDPs.

Conduct of Activities

The TA team, including staff and consultants, was highly engaged during the TA implementation period between February 2017 and September 2021 to achieve the four TA outputs. These included: (i) 9 missions by ADB and TA consulting team; (ii) 72 field visits by the TA consultants to discuss with the relevant stakeholders, local government officials and elected representatives in the selected districts; and (iii) 52 TA consulting (online) team meetings to develop the deliverables.⁵ The government requested to combine outputs 1 and 2, i.e., the production of a sector roadmap (output 1) and the RDPs (output 2), because of overlapping information. The following key activities were undertaken:

Output 1: Sector road map for inclusive and sustainable urban growth endorsed (substantially achieved) and Output 2: RDPs prepared by provincial and local Governments (substantially achieved).

- Preparation of three city development plans (CDPs) in 2018–2019, initially for Abbottabad, Mardan, and Peshawar. The CDPs were eventually upgraded to RDPs for Greater Abbottabad,⁶ Swat,⁷ and Greater Peshawar,⁸ covering sector roadmaps (output 1) as well for each region. The RDPs (with sector roadmaps) were used as the resource materials for two projects: (i) the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Cities Improvement Project (KPCIP),⁹ and (ii) the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Cities Improvement Projects – second Project Readiness Financing (KPCIP PRF-2).¹⁰
- 72 field visits by consultant team to get first-hand knowledge of the on-ground situation and hold discussions with the relevant stakeholders. The outcome of these discussions was used as the basis for developing the sector roadmaps and main part of the RDPs covering community participation, empowerment, and inclusive and integrated urban development.

³ The original scope included two RDPs for Greater Peshawar and Greater Abbottabad. The government requested ADB to prepare RDPs for other KPCIP cities, instead of the three knowledge products initially envisaged under the TA. A total of three RDPs were prepared for Greater Abbottabad, Greater Peshawar, and Swat.

⁴ The city of Kohat is covered under the Greater Peshawar RDP, while the city of Mingora is covered under the Swat RDP.

⁵ During the COVID-19 pandemic, consultants were unable to visit Peshawar due to several lockdowns imposed by the provincial government. The consultant's team, therefore, had to complete meetings and discussions with the stakeholders using Zoom and MS Teams.

⁶ ADB. 2022. [Greater Abbottabad Regional Development Plan](#). Consultant's report. Manila (TA 9223-PAK).

⁷ ADB. 2022. [Swat Regional Development Plan](#). Consultant's report. Manila (TA 9223-PAK).

⁸ ADB. 2022. [Greater Peshawar Regional Development Plan](#). Consultant's report. Manila (TA 9223-PAK).

⁹ ADB. [Islamic Republic of Pakistan: Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Cities Improvement Project](#).

¹⁰ ADB. [Islamic Republic of Pakistan for the Pakistan: Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Cities Improvement Projects – Second Project Readiness Financing](#).

- Review of relevant documents, statistics, data about three selected regions (Greater Abbottabad, Greater Peshawar and Swat), and official records of the local administration and water and sanitation companies in the three regions.
- Online launching event in February 2022 organized by the Secretary Local Government, the Government of KP. Team tried to arrange a physical launching event of the RDPs with the extensions of TA implementation period, but it was not realized due to prolonged lockdowns with COVID-19 pandemic.
- Preparation of interactive story map presentations under the ArcGIS format summarizing the key findings of the three RDPs.¹¹ These story map presentations were shared with wider audiences through social media.

Output 3: Institutional capacity for implementation agencies built (achieved).

- Output 3 activities include prioritization of training recipients, training needs assessments and delivery of training. All were completed as planned in coordination with the government and KPCIP Project Readiness Financing (PRF) consultants. This led to the government allocating a dedicated output and substantive resources for gender equity and mainstreaming (e.g., 100 scholarship opportunities for female students) under KPCIP (footnote 8).
- Team met with Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) in September 2020 and March 2021 to discuss the scope of RDPs and how ensuing project, KPCIP, will complement JICA-funded water treatment facility in Abbottabad. JICA and ADB agreed to work closely for future investments and urban planning.

Output 4: Lessons from pilots on accredited training and municipal business planning mainstreamed within the urban sector (partially achieved).

- A Resilience Accelerator Workshop was held in December 2018 in Singapore, which was attended by relevant stakeholders from the selected districts of the KP province, UCCRTF and ADB staff. The TA team shared the main findings of the RDPs with other participants as good practice.
- The Water Operations Training by Maynilad Water Academy was held in November 2019. This was attended by over 50 officials and municipal operators in two separate sessions, including the first session for municipal operators and the second session for the government decision makers (e.g., minister and political leaders). The participants learned and applied good practices to their municipal operations in the five cities in the areas of clean water supply and sanitation. As a result, KPCIP has integrated new technologies (e.g., activated sludge plant) and nonrevenue water management by water and sanitation services companies.
- Draft municipal business plan was prepared but yet to be integrated in the government system. The government will consider further developing it for future initiatives.

Budget Utilization. A total of \$2.40 million (\$0.40 million from TASF and \$2.00 million from JFPR) was approved under the TA. In May 2019, a request for additional TA category and reallocation of funds under the TASF was processed to add a new line category for “seminars, workshops, and conferences”, with a reallocation of \$62,000 from the consultant’s category under TASF. The total TA amount was reduced to \$2.30 million in July 2020, then further to \$2.24 million in August 2021, due to requests for partial TA cancellations under TASF. The remainder of \$0.48 million was not utilized, due to cancellations of RDP launching events and a study visit to Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia amid continuous COVID-19 pandemic.

Technical Assistance Assessment Ratings

Criterion	Assessment	Rating
Relevance	<p>Strategic alignment. The TA was fully aligned with policy commitment by KP government, especially the Sarhad Provincial Conservation Strategy,¹² Integrated Development Strategy 2014–2018,¹³ Sustainable Development Strategy,¹⁴ Economic Recovery Plan 2020–2023,¹⁵ and Tribal Decade Strategy 2020–2030.¹⁶ All these policy and strategic documents underlined the need for sustainable urban development and inclusive economic growth.</p> <p>TA design. The TA type was most appropriate to address knowledge, policy, and institutional capacity gaps in strategic planning. Its design was</p>	Relevant

¹¹ Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and ADB. Regional Development Plans for [Greater Abbottabad](#), [Greater Peshawar](#), and [Swat](#).

¹² Government of North-West Frontier Province and International Union for Conservation of Nature. 1996. [Sarhad Provincial Conservation Strategy](#). Karachi.

¹³ Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. 2014. [Integrated Development Strategy 2014–2018](#). Peshawar.

¹⁴ Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. 2019. [Sustainable Development Strategy: A Medium Term Development Framework 2019–23 for Khyber Pakhtunkhwa](#). Peshawar.

¹⁵ Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. 2020. [Azm-e-Nau – The Spirit of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa: Economic Recovery Plan 2020–2023](#). Peshawar.

¹⁶ Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. 2019. [Tribal Decade Strategy 2020–2030](#). Peshawar.

Criterion	Assessment	Rating
	also well aligned with the pipelined investment projects so that the TA outputs contributed to two investment projects—KPCIP and KPCIP PRF-2. TA operations. Timely changes required to upgrade CDPs to RDPs and to merge the RDPs and sector roadmap were undertaken to enhance documents' relevance to the government.	
Effectiveness	The TA substantially achieved the intended DMF outcome: improved urban inclusivity, sustainability, and resilience in investment program in KP province. The government approved two investment projects in 2021 based on knowledge products and capacity development supported under the TA, mainly RDPs with sector roadmaps and other documents integrating gender, climate change, and poverty considerations (Outputs 1 and 2), and institutional strengthening targets for sustainability (Output 3). The TA supported inclusive capacity development—from municipal operators to policymakers—to yield more sustainable results. More than 200 staff were trained for the preparation of the RDPs including women, and over 70 provincial stakeholders, including the local government minister, chief economist, other key decision makers, municipal service management personnel and operators joined technical training in Maynilad Water Academy, and applied the acquired concepts and good practices to their municipal operations (Output 4).	Effective
Efficiency	The TA was within budget and disbursed in a timely manner. The government initially envisaged completing RDPs and disseminating them through a public meeting but it was not possible due to prolonged lockdowns with COVID-19. The city officials and municipal operators were also not able to organize a study visit on solid waste management operations in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia due to the pandemic. The budget was therefore not fully utilized despite three extensions of the TA completion date. The TA experienced slow processing and implementation. Finalization of the TA design was delayed for reaching consensus among different stakeholders. The delayed consultant recruitment process further impacted on the TA implementation timeline and overall efficiency. ¹⁷	Less than efficient
Overall Assessment	The TA's design was relevant and aligned with the government's development agenda. The TA's intended outcome was substantially achieved. Three of the four outputs (75%) were either substantially achieved or achieved. While implementation delays were more than 3 years as a result of three extensions, the TA was implemented within the budget. The government's key planning agency improved their knowledge of international best practices in the urban sector while best practices in the delivery of urban services were shared with service providers. As a result, the government approved two investment projects (KPCIP and KPCIP PRF-2) based on knowledge products and works drawn from TA.	Successful
Sustainability	Sustainability mechanisms are in place and resources allocated by the government. These include: (i) key findings and recommendations of RDPs are aligned with investment projects; (ii) the government will sustain the TA results with the \$650 million investment project (KPCIP), benefitting 3.5 million citizens (footnote 8); and (iii) the government allocated its human resources for the project implementation arrangements as part of their overall commitment for the project sustainability. With strong linkages among TA outputs, financing with KPCIP, and the government's commitment, the TA outputs will be sustained. The government requested ADB to process a new TA for similar initiatives.	Most likely sustainable

Lessons Learned and Recommendations

Design and/or planning	CWRD started processing the TA in March 2015 in consultation with the Government of KP. TA processing team fielded at least two missions to process this TA but the scope of the TA continued to change because of changes in ADB project officers which impacted continuity in communications with government and relevant
------------------------	---

¹⁷ After the first ranked firm declined the contract offer, the second ranked consultant's team was mobilized but took time to implement the assignment under complex operational environment.

	stakeholders and delayed recruitments of the consulting firm which affected downstream TA implementation timeline. To maintain relevance of design and planning during TA implementation, it is recommended to (i) support smooth transition between ADB project officers, (ii) maintain cross communication and coordination with the government and other partners, and (iii) start consultant recruitment processes early based on strategic procurement assessment (see below).
Implementation and/or delivery	The TA initially experienced implementation delays. It took more than 9 months for ADB to recruit the consulting firms due to the low number of qualified bidders for the consultancy positions. ¹⁸ For all loan projects, ADB started preparing Strategic Procurement Assessment (SPA) that covers external influences analysis, capacity assessments of EA, operating environment (e.g., security and safety), risk management and consultant recruitment strategy, among others. It is recommended that the TA processing team analyzes the operating environment during TA processing. Other significant constraints were a lack of basic data including georeferenced information on key infrastructure, sector development, planning boundaries, and service delivery. The lack of such information and, in some cases, the contradictory nature of information obtained, diverted valuable resources into basic data collection. It is recommended that the TA processing team analyzes the operating environment and develops a simplified consultant recruitment strategy or refers to available SPA during TA processing.
Management of staff and consultant resources	ADB staff met with TA consultants on a regular basis to discuss TA progress, challenges, and ways forward. TA consultants were encouraged to visit ADB Pakistan Resident Mission whenever the team needed guidance locally, but it was not regularly arranged by the consultants. While ADB staff met regularly to discuss day-to-day operational issues, maintaining better communication channels and enhanced coordination among the consultants, ADB headquarters and resident mission staff is recommended. It is also recommended that a regular coordination meeting among the government, the consultants, and ADB take place to make sure all stakeholders identify challenges and solutions more systematically.
Knowledge building	The TA team worked with the water and sanitation services company (WSSC) as the focal entity for knowledge building in each region and it was proven to be effective to work with the same WSSC across different areas of work (urban planning, water sanitation, solid waste management, and gender). Each WSSC appointed the new knowledge building staff who facilitated the capacity development activities in a more integrated manner. It is recommended that future knowledge building activities be implemented through WSSC in KP province.
Stakeholder participation	TA consultants organized over 70 consultative meetings and focus group discussions and stakeholder's participations were active. TA consultants organized these meetings to ensure everyone felt safe and comfortable in sharing their thoughts while KP province is considered as one of the most culturally sensitive part of the country. Careful planning with cultural sensitivity is key to encouraging active stakeholder participation.
Partnership and cofinancing	During TA implementation, the TA team worked closely with key development partners for the processing of investment projects (e.g., Peshawar Sustainable Bus Rapid Transit Corridor Project, KPCIP) including Asian Infrastructure Investment Bank, Agence Française de Développement, Cities Development Initiative for Asia (CDIA), JICA, and UCCRTF and it is considered as a good practice. The above development partners have largely aligned their support in the same three regions which the TA supported. JICA provided valuable inputs in the RDP for Abbottabad, where JICA has major urban water and environmental sanitation investment in the city. It is recommended that ADB continues to work closely with other key development partners, including during the upstream TA design period.
Replication and/or scaling up	The Secretary Local Government (implementing agency) requested ADB to replicate the production of RDPs in other regions of KP province based on the positive experience under the TA. CWRD may develop a new proposal in 2023–2025 and the new TA pipeline, if approved, will finance the development of new RDPs. CWRD will discuss the proposal with SDCC and trust fund partners. WSSCs were exposed

¹⁸ Between 2013 and 2016, many international bidders were still reluctant to bid in project in KP province due to security reasons.

	to good practice on municipal services. In KP province, two other WSSCs were not included in the TA but it is recommended to invite these two WSSCs to participate in Maynilad Water Academy training.
Post-TA financial resources	The government allocated financial and human resources to implement the investment programs that were developed based on an integrated urban development under the TA. Establishing a strong linkage between knowledge TA and future investment program is a good practice and recommended.

Follow-up Actions

The Local Government, Elections & Rural Development Department, the Government of KP, launched the RDPs with sector roadmaps on 24 February 2022. The Secretary Local Government recommended the government to continue using the RDPs as the basis for future urban development initiatives for two reasons. First, the RDPs provide a long-term urban development framework with a planning horizon of 25 years. This allows the RDPs to consider key challenges to be addressed in the longer-term, such as the scarcity of water and the growing crisis of solid waste management. All these challenges fundamentally require a strategic, coordinated, and long-term perspective with end-to-end solutions, rather than a shorter-term, ad hoc approach. Second, the RDPs focus on integrated and sustainable urban development, rather than specific sectors. The RDPs reflect views and feedback of sector leaders, communities including participation of women, and other stakeholders to the maximum extent feasible, considering the constraints during the COVID-19 pandemic. An integrated urban development approach entails not only the identification of potential investments in infrastructure, but also the identification of necessary institutional reforms and capacity building in the organizations responsible for planning, service delivery, and regulation.

Transforming the vision of a long-term regional plan in RDPs into reality requires the sustained commitment of stakeholders at all levels. The executing agency used key outputs of the TA (in particular, the RDPs) as the basis for a \$650 million KPCIP which was approved in December 2021. The government of KP and ADB will continue to monitor the project implementation. ADB will use the RDPs for future pipeline development in the medium to longer term.

The executing agency and ADB were unable to widely disseminate the TA's outputs due to the COVID-19 pandemic, but the government agreed to organize a launching event of the RDPs once all the COVID-19 restrictions were lifted. The government also requested ADB to process a similar TA to support urban development planning in other parts of Pakistan.

Prepared by:
Kiyoshi Nakamitsu

Designation and Division:
Principal Urban Development Specialist, CWUW

DESIGN AND MONITORING FRAMEWORK

Impact(s) Renewed focus on inclusive and sustainable urban development in provincial policies and allocations ^a		
Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Achievements
Outcome Improved urban inclusivity, sustainability, and resilience in investment programming in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	GOKP endorsed investments for urban areas increased by Q1 2019 (2017 baseline: to be established) ^b	a. Substantially achieved. The government approved two investment projects (KPCIP and PRF-II) in 2021 based on knowledge products and capacity development work being supported under the TA.
Outputs 1. Sector road map for inclusive and sustainable urban growth endorsed 2. RDPs prepared by provincial and local Governments	1a. A new sector road map for inclusive and sustainable urban growth that is gender-inclusive and focuses on small and medium-sized enterprises, the poor, and climate change endorsed by Q3 2017 (2016 baseline: NA) 1b. At least 200 citizens and decision makers, of whom 30% will be women and poor persons, participated in consultations on the sector road map by Q2 2017 (2016 baseline: NA) 2a. Two new RDPs, including a 10–15-year urban investment plan that is gender-inclusive and focuses on small and medium-sized enterprises, the urban poor, and climate change, endorsed by Q3 2017 (2016 baseline: NA) 2b. Fifty professionals from the region, of whom 20% will be women, trained on the job on the process and principles of formulating RDPs by Q3 2017 (2016 baseline: NA) 2c. RDP guidelines and manuals with a focus on the participation of small and medium-sized enterprises, the poor, women, and climate change issued by the provincial government by Q3	1a. Substantially achieved. The Sector Road Maps as part of the three RDPs were circulated to the Government in Q2 of 2019 and they were used for developing scope of PRF and KPCIP. Sector roadmaps were eventually integrated as part of RDPs and the Secretary Local Government endorsed the RDPs through an online launching event in February 2022. 1b. Achieved. The Government of KP and the Water and Sanitation Services Companies in Abbottabad, Mardan, and Peshawar participated in the preparation of the sector road map as part of the RDP development between 2018 and 2019. The TA consultants estimate that more than 300 citizens (of which about 30% were women) and decision makers participated in a series of consultations. 2a. Achieved. Following the government's request, a total of three RDPs were prepared, and the government has used them for investment preparations and other purposes. The RDPs provide a 25-year planning horizon, summarizing the current status of the urban sector, identifying key development drivers for gender-inclusive economic growth (together with SMEs), and providing a holistic plan for future development. The government endorsed the RDPs through an online launching event in February 2022. 2b. Achieved. Over 200 professionals (at least 20% women) received on-the-job training during the preparation of RDPs through 72 consultative meetings and focus group discussions held from 2018 to 2020. 2c. Not achieved. RDPs covered the issues of broader economic growth, poverty, gender, and climate change as part of the documents and participants of RDP preparation were trained and guided by respective experts (TA consultants) but the TA did not prepare specific guidelines or manuals as the

Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Achievements
3. Institutional capacity for implementation agencies built	2017 (2016 baseline: NA) 3. Organizational improvement plan developed including legal set-up and allocation of human resources (with an increased number of women employees), and financial resources endorsed by the provincial government by Q2 2017 (2016 baseline: NA)	preparation of these documents were considered inefficient. 3. Achieved. Institutional strengthening and capacity building assessment (i.e., organizational improvement plan) were completed in coordination with KPCIP PRF consultants and it was reflected into PC-1 of KPCIP eventually approved by the government. The government of KP allocated the financial resources for KPCIP that has various gender focused activities (e.g., 100 scholarship opportunities for female students) WSSCs are also increasing female employees between 2022 and 2024.
4. Lessons from pilots on accredited training and municipal business planning mainstreamed within the urban sector	4a. More than 100 people (25% women) trained, and at least 50% of the total participants received certificates for training on planning, implementation or maintenance by Q4 2017 (2016 baseline: NA) 4b. A new municipal business plan with targets for increasing female staffing prepared based on a financial management and life cycle cost pilot by Q4 2017 (2016 baseline: NA) 4c. Urban sector professions, at least 10 women, from Khyber Pakhtunkhwa participated in the urban forum in Q4 2017 (2016 baseline: 12 persons) 4d. Three new knowledge products produced, with at least one on integrating urban climate change resilience principles into urban planning and one on gender mainstreaming by Q1 2018 (2016 baseline: NA)	4a. Achieved. More than 50 officials from Water and Sanitation Services Companies (WSSCs), P&DD, Local Government Department, and others participated in training on planning of municipal services in Singapore and Maynilad Water Academy in the Philippines in Q4 2019. All of them received certificates. WSSC participants then shared experience with their respective staff upon their return (estimated 200 local WSSC and government of KP staff, of which about 25% were female staff). Lessons were integrated in the \$650 million investment project. 4b. Partially achieved. The municipal business plans were drafted in 2020 but the quality of the plans was not satisfactory. PRF consultants redrafted the plans using TA consultant's input. 4c. Substantially achieved. 49 urban sector professionals, including 10 women, actively participated in the urban resilience accelerator in December 2018. 4d. Partially achieved. EA requested ADB to produce three RDPs instead of three knowledge products. A climate change resilience report was prepared in coordination with UCCRTF and CDIA. Gender assessment was prepared by PRF consultant. The municipal business planning document was drafted but the quality of the report was compromised and was not adopted by the government.

Actual Key Activities with Milestones

1. Sector road map for inclusive and sustainable urban growth endorsed
 - 1.1. Agree on survey methodology for primary data collection with the provincial government, Q1 2018
 - 1.2. Identify priority issues and solutions in consultations with stakeholders, Q2 2018
2. RDPs prepared by provincial and local governments
 - 2.1. Carry out a complete survey (review, focus group, survey, geographic information system, interviews, expert panel, and on-site observation) for three RDPs, Q2 2020
 - 2.2. Formulate three RDPs with the participation of the stakeholders, and train staff on the relevant principles and process, Q4 2020
 - 2.3. Prepare and test RDP guidelines with a checklist for incorporating measures to improve poverty and gender mainstreaming, Q4 2020
3. Institutional capacity for key sector implementing agencies built
 - 3.1. Prioritize implementing agencies, Q2 2018
 - 3.2. Engage four national consultants to build the capacity of prioritized implementing agencies, Q2 2020
 - 3.3. Train key staff in selected implementing agencies, Q2 2021
4. Lessons from pilots on accredited training and municipal business planning mainstreamed within the urban sector
 - 4.1. Complete detailed municipal financial assessment for the selected cities, Q3 2018
 - 4.2. Conduct training and testing, Q4 2018
 - 4.3. Discuss policy and procedural changes in rates, fees, and tariffs with the provincial government, Q2 2020
 - 4.4. Write, edit, and post or print urban sector roadmap and three regional development plans, Q2 2021

Actual Inputs

Asian Development Bank: \$222,020.14 (TASF-other sources)

Japan Fund for Prosperous and Resilient Asia and the Pacific: \$1,535,624.90

Government: \$50,000 (estimated in-kind contribution from the government in the form of counterpart staff, office space, space for workshops, and other in-kind contributions).

CDIA = Cities Development Initiative for Asia, KPCIP = Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Cities Improvement Project, NA = not applicable, PATA = policy and advisory technical assistance, PRF = project readiness financing, Q = quarter, RDP = regional development plan, TASF = technical assistance special fund, UCCRTF = Urban Climate Change Resilience Trust Fund.

^a International Growth Centre. [Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Economic Strategy Report](#). This is also articulated in the Government of Pakistan's Vision 2025.

^b There is no baseline data available for most indicators. Baselines was established under the PATA.
Source: Asian Development Bank.

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COST

Table A2.1: Technical Assistance Cost by Activity
(\$'000)

Item	Amount			
	Original	Revised (Jul 2020)	Revised (Aug 2021)	Actual
1. Consultants	1,869.94	1,656.75	1,651.98	1,586.61
2. Equipment ^a	54.00	54.00	54.00	0.00
3. Training, seminars, and conferences	166.45	378.45	321.64	157.39
4. Surveys	50.00	45.91	45.91	13.65
5. Miscellaneous administration and support costs ^b	116.22	90.61	90.61	0.00
6. Contingencies	143.40	74.28	74.28	0.00
Total	2,400.00	2,300.00	2,238.42	1,757.65

^a Includes computers, networking, complaint registration, monitors and data displays, printers and scanners, and additional gadgets, e.g., global positioning system and software. Other equipment will be procured subject to prior agreement with ADB. The equipment will be used primarily for the city's financial management and life cycle pilot under output 4. The equipment will be handed over to the implementing agency.

^b Includes secretarial, administrative and technical support.

Source: Asian Development Bank estimates.

Table A2.2: Technical Assistance Cost by Financier
(\$'000)

	Asian Development Bank ^a	Japan Fund for Prosperous and Resilient Asia and the Pacific ^b	Total Cost
1. Original	400.00	2,000.00	2,400.00
2. Revised (Jul 2020)	300.00	2,000.00	2,300.00
3. Revised (Aug 2021)	238.42	2,000.00	2,238.42
4. Actual	222.02	1,535.62	1,757.65
5. Unused	16.40	464.38	480.78

^a Financed by ADB's Technical Assistance Special Fund (TASF-others).

^b Administered by ADB. The Japan Fund for Prosperous and Resilient Asia and the Pacific's proposal was submitted as part of the second batch for 2016 on 17 May 2016 and was approved by the Government of Japan on 28 June 2016.

Source: Asian Development Bank estimates.