



# Technical Assistance Report

---

Project Number: 50217-001  
Regional—Capacity Development Technical Assistance (R-CDTA)  
December 2016

## Strengthening International Food Safety Standards in Agricultural Value Chains in the Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation Member Countries

This document is being disclosed to the public in accordance with ADB's Public Communications Policy 2011.

**Asian Development Bank**

## ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	–	Asian Development Bank
CAREC	–	Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation
CMC	–	CAREC member country
EU	–	European Union
FAO	–	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
PRC	–	People’s Republic of China
SPS	–	sanitary and phytosanitary
TA	–	technical assistance
WHO	–	World Health Organization
WTO	–	World Trade Organization

## NOTE

In this report, "\$" refers to US dollars.

<b>Vice-President</b>	W. Zhang, Operations 1
<b>Director General</b>	S. O’Sullivan, Central and West Asia Department (CWRD)
<b>Director</b>	A. Siddiq, Environment, Natural Resources and Agriculture Division, CWRD
<b>Team leader</b>	S. Shrestha, Senior Economist, CWRD
<b>Team members</b>	G. Bui, Senior Natural Resources and Agriculture Economist, CWRD C. Cabrales-Chiong, Senior Operations Assistant, CWRD

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

## CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AT A GLANCE	
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. ISSUES	1
III. THE CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE	3
A. Impact and Outcome	3
B. Methodology and Key Activities	3
C. Cost and Financing	5
D. Implementation Arrangements	5
IV. THE PRESIDENT'S DECISION	5
APPENDIXES	
1. Design and Monitoring Framework	6
2. Cost Estimates and Financing Plan	8
3. Outline Terms of Reference for Consultants	9

## CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AT A GLANCE

<b>1. Basic Data</b>		<b>Project Number: 50217-001</b>	
<b>Project Name</b>	Strengthening International Food Safety Standards in Agricultural Value Chains in the Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation Member Countries	<b>Department /Division</b>	CWRD/CWER
<b>Country</b>	REG	<b>Executing Agency</b>	Asian Development Bank
<b>2. Sector</b>	<b>Subsector(s)</b>	<b>ADB Financing (\$ million)</b>	
✓ Agriculture, natural resources and rural development	Agriculture research and application		0.25
	Agro-industry, marketing, and trade		0.25
		<b>Total</b>	<b>0.50</b>
<b>3. Strategic Agenda</b>	<b>Subcomponents</b>	<b>Climate Change Information</b>	
Inclusive economic growth (IEG)	Pillar 2: Access to economic opportunities, including jobs, made more inclusive	Climate Change impact on the Project	Low
Environmentally sustainable growth (ESG)	Natural resources conservation		
<b>4. Drivers of Change</b>	<b>Components</b>	<b>Gender Equity and Mainstreaming</b>	
Partnerships (PAR)	Implementation Regional organizations	No gender elements (NGE)	✓
<b>5. Poverty and SDG Targeting</b>		<b>Location Impact</b>	
Geographic Targeting	Yes	Regional	High
Household Targeting	No		
SDG Targeting	Yes		
SDG Goals	SDG17		
<b>6. TA Category:</b>	B		
<b>7. Safeguard Categorization</b>	Not Applicable		
<b>8. Financing</b>			
<b>Modality and Sources</b>		<b>Amount (\$ million)</b>	
<b>ADB</b>		<b>0.50</b>	
Capacity development technical assistance: Technical Assistance Special Fund		0.50	
<b>Cofinancing</b>		<b>0.00</b>	
None		0.00	
<b>Counterpart</b>		<b>0.00</b>	
None		0.00	
<b>Total</b>		<b>0.50</b>	
<b>9. Effective Development Cooperation</b>			
Use of country procurement systems	No		
Use of country public financial management systems	No		

## I. INTRODUCTION

1. At the 14th Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation (CAREC) Ministerial Conference, a joint ministerial statement endorsed the common agenda for Sanitary and Phytosanitary (SPS) Reforms and Modernization in Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia, in September 2015.<sup>1</sup> The endorsement emanated from technical assistance (TA) from Asian Development Bank (ADB) for Promoting Cooperation in Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures for Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation for trade facilitation in CAREC member countries (CMCs).<sup>2</sup> This proposed regional capacity development TA will support CMCs' implementation of food safety to international standards along agricultural value-chain systems.<sup>3</sup> The expected impact, outcome, and outputs of the proposed TA were explained to the delegates from 11 CMCs at the 23rd Trade Policy Coordination Committee Meeting in Islamabad, Pakistan, on 18 July 2016. Following the briefing, a regional food safety initiative was launched at the CAREC senior official meeting. Its progress will be reported at the CAREC's senior official and ministerial meetings.

## II. ISSUES

2. Increased globalization of trade, climate change, and intensification of agriculture have reduced the resilience of agricultural production systems and increased their vulnerability to pests, diseases, and hazardous substances. During 1980–2010, international trade in agricultural and food products increased from \$230 billion to almost \$1,100 billion—a more than fourfold increase. The expansion of trade also brought high-profile food safety scares, like the bovine spongiform encephalopathy (mad cow disease) problem in the European Union, or the E. coli outbreak in the western United States and in Asia. In the People's Republic of China (PRC), six infants died and 300,000 babies were affected with painful kidney stones after drinking melamine-tainted infant milk formula in 2008.<sup>4</sup> The World Health Organization estimates that 600 million—almost 1 in 10 people in the world—fall ill after eating contaminated food and 420,000 die every year.<sup>5</sup> A single event of foodborne disease outbreak can result in huge economic losses and cause a collapse of consumer confidence, loyalty, and reputations of companies and countries. The impact of food safety scares on international trade can be devastating. Food safety issues are playing an increasingly dominant role in domestic food production and consumption systems, and in agro-food trade.<sup>6</sup>

3. The international trade in food products is regulated with ever more stringent requirements. The SPS Agreement of the World Trade Organization (WTO) obliges the countries to harmonize the requirements with the international standards for food safety and animal and plant health. The standards set by the Codex Alimentarius Commission are the international reference for the WTO food safety measures along the value chain. The World Animal Health Organization and the International Plant Protection Convention each set standards. All standards are closely linked and those on food safety measures have spillover

---

<sup>1</sup> The meeting was represented by 10 CAREC member countries: Afghanistan, Azerbaijan, the People's Republic of China, Kazakhstan, the Kyrgyz Republic, Mongolia, Pakistan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan. Georgia became a member country of CAREC in 2016.

<sup>2</sup> ADB. 2013. *Technical Assistance for Promoting Cooperation in Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures for Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation*. Manila.

<sup>3</sup> The TA first appeared in the business opportunities section of ADB's website on 9 June 2016.

<sup>4</sup> P. Foster. 2011. Top 10 Chinese Food Scandals. *The Telegraph*. 27 April. <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/asia/china/8476080/Top-10-Chinese-Food-Scandals.html>.

<sup>5</sup> World Health Organization (WHO). Food Safety. <http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs399/en/>.

<sup>6</sup> M. Maertens and J. Swinnen. 2014. *Agriculture Trade and Development: A Value Chain Perspective*. *WTO Working Paper*. Economic Research and Statistics Division, 2015-04. Geneva: World Trade Organization.

effects on animal and plant health.<sup>7</sup> These international norms apply regardless of whether a country is a WTO member. Also, a country is not allowed to impose higher standards on imported products than those applied to domestic produce.<sup>8</sup>

4. **International food safety standards in member countries.** The CMCs strategically located at crossroads in Asia and Europe have the potential to substantially increase trade across central Asia. Trade in high-value products in the region—fruits, vegetables, meat, and dairy—increased from 32% in 1980 to 41% in 2010, the highest increase among food products. These are highly perishable products that pose serious food safety risks if proper safety standards are not followed during production, processing, transportation, and all the way to consumption. The movement of perishable products through border-crossing points in the CMCs is considerably delayed by multiple regulatory inspections and clearance procedures related to food safety. Such inefficiencies are costly and hamper international trade significantly. The International Finance Corporation states that a key hurdle for Central Asian countries to increase exports of primary and processed food products to the markets of the European Union, Russia, and the PRC is the slow adoption of internationally recognized food safety standards.

5. Moreover, different levels of food safety standards currently practiced among CMCs are equivalent to nontariff barriers that restrict trade. Harmonizing standards and regulations and expediting border-crossing procedures with other CMCs and global markets can yield significant benefits. Single-window facilities for processing entry and exit customs formalities, automated customs information systems, and coordinated management of border clearance procedures can be effective in avoiding duplication and overlap across various customs agencies. Establishing these measures will yield substantial benefits. The World Bank estimates that each day of delay from harvest to market corresponds to 0.8% of tariff equivalent.<sup>9</sup>

6. All CMCs engage in agro-food export and import. Incorporating harmonized international food safety standards in domestic systems provides protection from import sources and can also reduce imports. For example, urban populations in the Kyrgyz Republic and Tajikistan now prefer imported frozen and processed meat, dairy products, and vegetables from countries perceived to have high food safety standards.

7. Compliance with international food safety standards requires investments in the development of capacity, institutionalization of regulations, upgrades to infrastructure facilities, accreditation of laboratories, coordination between government ministries (i.e., agriculture, environment, health, trade, customs, and border-crossing entities), and procedures and incentive structures to develop the private sector. For small farmers to benefit from international agro-food trade, investments in farm infrastructure, producer associations, and third-party quality control are also important.<sup>10</sup> These high investment needs are a contributing factor in the

---

<sup>7</sup> The International Plant Protection Convention develops measures to control pests and pathogens of plants, but any pesticides to be used in plant protection are evaluated scientifically by the Joint Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) and WHO Meeting on Pesticide Residues. The Joint FAO and WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives and Contaminants evaluates the veterinary drug needed to protect animal health, whereas the Joint FAO and WHO Expert Meeting on Microbiological Risk Assessment evaluates human health hazards arising from zoonotic pathogens associated with animals.

<sup>8</sup> WTO member states have the right to adapt and deviate from these international benchmarks if stricter regulations are based on scientific principles of risk assessment in the interest of human, plant, and animal health.

<sup>9</sup> The World Bank annually measures the progress of countries around the world in facilitating trade through the World Bank Logistics Performance Index and the Ease of Doing Business Index. These ratings indicate the overall performance of countries in facilitating trade.

<sup>10</sup> C. B. Barrett et al. 2009. Agrifood Industry Transformation and Farmers in Developing Countries. *World Development*. 37(11). pp. 1717–1727.

slow progress toward codex compliance. The standard-related investment needs of CMCs are particularly high because they are transitioning from Soviet-era state standards that are not compatible with the codex.<sup>11</sup>

### III. THE CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

#### A. Impact and Outcome

8. The impact of the project is aligned with improved public health and facilitation of trade in agro-food products in CMCs. The outcome will be stronger institutional systems for the operationalization of international food safety standards.

#### B. Methodology and Key Activities

9. CMCs' compliance with the main food safety principles and mechanisms varies greatly. Hence, two tiers of support should be provided to CMCs (i.e., groups I and II) based on their progress in aligning regulations and systems with the international food safety standards. Five countries are in group 1: Afghanistan, Azerbaijan, Kyrgyz Republic, Pakistan, and Tajikistan.<sup>12</sup> Group 1 countries are members of the codex and, except for Azerbaijan, are also members of the WTO. However, their adoption of the international food safety measures has been slower than in other countries.

10. Group 2 countries are Georgia, the PRC, Kazakhstan, Mongolia, and Uzbekistan. They are members of the codex commission and, except for Uzbekistan, are also members of the WTO. Their regulations and infrastructure facilities are more advanced than those in other CMCs, and are aligned with international food safety standards. The PRC and Kazakhstan, in most cases, have the recommended standard equipment and procedures and internationally accredited laboratories. In Mongolia, ADB approved a loan in 2015 to help modernize SPS standards.<sup>13</sup> Although Uzbekistan is not a WTO member, it has aligned its food safety standards with the international norms. Four outputs are expected by TA completion.

11. **Output 1: Regulations for meeting international food safety standards developed.** Integrated national food safety legislation and strategies for implementing the international food safety standards will be developed for the group 1 countries that have not yet initiated the process. The national strategies will aim to (i) establish a national food safety unit consisting of government and private sector representatives, (ii) designate an agency to set food safety standards, and (iii) designate a separate, certificate-issuing agency with a mandate to verify compliance. Activities envisioned for this output are to develop national food safety legislation and strategies for Afghanistan, Azerbaijan, and Pakistan.<sup>14</sup>

---

<sup>11</sup> Russia's accession to the WTO in 2012 obligates the country to replace its Soviet-era state standards with the codex. This in turn forces other former Soviet Union countries to adopt the codex to continue to trade with their traditional and new trading partners.

<sup>12</sup> Turkmenistan also falls under group 1 but it is not included for outputs 1 and 2 because ADB has approved separate TA on food safety (ADB. Turkmenistan: Modernization of Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures for Food Safety. <https://www.adb.org/projects/49343-001/main>). Under this regional TA, Turkmenistan will be included for outputs 3 and 4, which were not covered under the Turkmenistan TA.

<sup>13</sup> ADB. 2015. *Report and Recommendation of the President to the Board of Directors: Proposed Loan to Mongolia for Regional Upgrades of Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures for Trade Project*. Manila.

<sup>14</sup> Tajikistan is developing its national food safety law, while the Kyrgyz Republic is crafting its law on food safety. These documents are in their draft stage. The TA may help finalize the laws and strategies as appropriate.

12. **Output 2: Laboratory rationalization and infrastructure requirements for applying international food safety standards identified.** Adopting international food safety standards involves adopting preventive measures along the food chain. Infrastructure required to apply regulations and guidelines includes laboratories to test products for compliance with the international food safety standards and a referral laboratory for providing services such as reference material for performance testing, quality assurance, and for performing special analysis. At the import control border, facilities for rapid field tests will be made for further testing at the referral laboratories, if needed. Activities envisioned for output 2 include (i) identifying a central laboratory that can be upgraded to a referral laboratory with international accreditation (International Organization for Standardization 17025:2005);<sup>15</sup> and (ii) indicative costing infrastructure, laboratory equipment, and other logistic systems.

13. **Output 3: Capacity of value chain actors to implement food safety to international standards strengthened.** Institutional capacity constraints are major obstacles to the enforcement of international food safety standards. The market structure in most CMCs is layered and involves different food safety managements—international export market, emerging domestic market based on food supply chains, and traditional markets. Different strategies are required to develop safety standards to improve these systems.

14. The capacity development output will provide training, workshops, and networking opportunities to strengthen inter-CMC cooperation. Technicians and officials will be instructed in regional workshops to train their country's key value chain operators.<sup>16</sup>

15. **Output 4: CAREC food safety network developed.** In 2015, CMCs have given higher priority to food security issues. Harmonizing internationally accredited food safety parameters across CMCs for credibility and consistency of quality control is highly desired. Economy of scale and similarity in agro-climate and ecosystems reinforce the importance of regional harmonization. The regional food safety initiative would be a launch pad to set up the CAREC food safety network. Such a network could be instrumental in regional cooperation to harmonize standards and regulations governing agro-food trade; expedite border-crossing procedures; and manage transboundary contaminations, diseases, and pests. The network could support harmonization of standards, technical regulations, conformity assessment regimes, and sharing of information to build capacity in food inspection and certification.

16. The European Food Safety Authority and the Association of Southeast Asian Nations' Food Safety Network could be models for the CAREC food safety network. The network could help carry out food safety risk assessments, which require multidisciplinary expertise that not all countries may have. The CMCs' national referral laboratories could provide analytical services to other members in the network, so that each country need not invest in equipment that may not be used daily.

17. To further support the achievement of the above outputs, ADB plans to carry out the following activities subject to compliance with the required procedures and approvals: (i) develop key code of practices and guidelines; (ii) develop national food safety network unit to strengthen the implementation of the international food safety standards; (iii) develop an action plan for the CAREC food safety network; (iv) develop plans for national and regional referral

<sup>15</sup> ISO/IEC 17025:2005 (en). General Requirements for the Competence of Testing and Calibration Laboratories. <https://www.iso.org/obp/ui/#iso:std:iso-iec:17025:ed-2:v1:en>.

<sup>16</sup> The operators would be encouraged to form an Association of Primary Producers, Association of Food Processors, and Association of Food Importers and Exporters. These associations would be encouraged to share information and provide training to operators of member producers or processors.

laboratories, including a plan for border inspection laboratories accreditation and an audit plan; (v) conduct in-country and regional training to technician and value chain inspectors (i.e., government officials and private sectors) to effectively implement good hygienic practices, food safety traceability, and hazard analysis and critical control point; and (vii) conduct regional workshops, study tours for knowledge sharing among developing countries, and networking and finalization of the TA.

### **C. Cost and Financing**

18. The TA is estimated to cost \$500,000, which will be financed on a grant basis by ADB's Technical Assistance Special Fund (TASF-Others). Subject to compliance with the required procedures and approvals, ADB plans to secure additional financing in the amount of \$1.5 million to further support the outputs of the TA.

### **D. Implementation Arrangements**

19. The TA will be implemented over 2.5 years (March 2017–August 2019). ADB will be the executing agency through the Environment, Natural Resources, and Agriculture Division of the Central and West Asia Department. The agriculture or health ministries of the respective CMCs will be the implementing agencies. The implementing agencies will form and lead a steering committee consisting of agencies and ministries from agriculture, commerce, health, trade, and customs, as well as cross-border agencies. The CAREC Institute will be a hub for training and workshops. The International Atomic Energy Agency will provide technical advice and support in its areas of expertise for outputs 3 and 4. The support will be provided through expert missions, as well as individual and group training and workshops, and facilitate harmonization of analytical techniques. Other international agencies will also be consulted, and opportunities for joint activities will be explored.

20. An international firm or consortium of specialist agencies will be recruited to implement the TA. ADB will recruit a team of consultants using the quality- and cost-based selection method with a quality–cost ratio of 90:10 and simplified technical proposals. Implementation requires 15 person-months of international and 25 person-months of national consultants. The reporting requirements include inception, interim, and final reports. The terms of reference are in Appendix 3.

21. The TA proceeds will be disbursed in accordance with ADB's *Technical Assistance Disbursement Handbook* (2010, as amended from time to time). All procurement will be carried out in accordance with ADB's Procurement Guidelines (2015, as amended from time to time), and consultants will be recruited in line with ADB's Guidelines on the Use of Consultants (2013, as amended from time to time).

## **IV. THE PRESIDENT'S DECISION**

22. The President, acting under the authority delegated by the Board, has approved the provision of technical assistance not exceeding the equivalent of \$500,000 on a grant basis for Strengthening International Food Safety Standards in Agricultural Value Chains in the Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation Member Countries, and hereby reports this action to the Board.

## DESIGN AND MONITORING FRAMEWORK

<b>Impact the TA is Aligned With:</b>			
Improved public health and facilitation of trade in agro-food products in CMCs. <sup>a</sup>			
<b>Results Chain</b>	<b>Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines</b>	<b>Data Sources and Reporting</b>	<b>Risks</b>
<p><b>Outcome</b></p> <p>Stronger institutional systems for the operationalization of international food safety standards</p>	<p>a. National food safety regulations in compliance with the international food safety standards developed by 2019</p> <p>b. National food safety network developed and implemented by 2019</p>	<p>a–b. TA reports</p>	<p>Coordination across ministries (agriculture, commerce, health, and trade) remains weak</p> <p>Delays in establishing CAREC food safety network in CMCs</p>
<p><b>Outputs</b></p> <p>1. Regulations for meeting international food safety standards developed</p> <p>(Group 1 countries)</p> <p>2. Laboratory rationalization and infrastructure requirements for applying international food safety standards identified</p> <p>(Group 1 countries)</p> <p>3. Capacity of value chain actors in implementing measures required to achieve international food safety standards strengthened</p> <p>(Groups 1 and 2 countries)</p> <p>4. CAREC food safety network developed</p> <p>(Groups 1 and 2 countries)</p>	<p>1. Executing agencies seek formal approval for the implementation of new and/or revised regulations by 2019</p> <p>2. Financing plan and cost estimate for the implementation of infrastructure, laboratories, and inspection services approved by respective executing agencies by 2019</p> <p>3. 33 food inspectors trained to conduct in-country training (i.e., 3 technical staff from each CMC) on international food safety standards by 2018</p> <p>4. A framework for the CAREC food safety network developed by 2019</p>	<p>1. Official confirmation by executing agencies</p> <p>2. Official confirmation by executing agencies</p> <p>3. TA reports</p> <p>4. Presentation at the CAREC senior official meeting and ministerial meeting in 2017</p>	<p>Significant delays in official approval of revised regulations</p> <p>Investment in laboratory infrastructure not given priority at completion of TA</p> <p>Political biases may negatively affect the regional networking activities</p>

**Key Activities with Milestones****1. Regulations for meeting international food safety standards developed**

- 1.1 Identify regulations, policies, strategies and guidelines, and codes of practice (Q2 2017).
- 1.2 Consult executing agencies on regulations to be revised and developed (Q2 2017).
- 1.3 Assess and recommend more effective institutional setup for risk analysis, standard setting, inspection, and verification of compliance related to domestic, import, and export products (Q3 2017).
- 1.4 Initiate development of the national regulations, policies, and strategies for Afghanistan, Azerbaijan, and Pakistan (Q4 2018).

**2. Laboratory rationalization and infrastructure requirements for applying international food safety standards identified**

- 2.1 Review existing infrastructure, including at border points, for performing inspection and verification of compliance with the international food safety standards (Q2 2017).
- 2.2 Develop financing plan for compliance with the international food safety standards (Q2 2019).

**3. Capacity of value chain actors to implement measures required to achieve international food safety standards strengthened**

- 3.1 Assess training needs for value chain analysis in informal and formal domestic food industry, import, and export sector (Q2 2017).
- 3.2 Develop a framework for a knowledge-sharing platform for inter-CMC cooperation, and develop early-warning system and emergency response to food safety problems affecting the region (Q2 2017).
- 3.3 Conduct training for selected trainers from food industry on GHP, HACCP, traceability, and inspection at border (Q2 2018).

**4. CAREC food safety network developed**

- 4.1 Consultations with CMCs' key officials on functions and responsibilities a of the CAREC food safety network (Q4 2018).

**Inputs**

ADB: \$500,000 (TASF-Others)

**Assumptions for Partner Financing**

Not applicable.

CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation, CMC = CAREC member country, GHP = good hygienic practice, HACCP = hazard analysis and critical control point, Q = quarter, TA = technical assistance.

<sup>a</sup> ADB. 2012. *CAREC 2020: A Strategic Framework for the Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation Program 2011–2020*. Manila.

Source: Asian Development Bank.

**COST ESTIMATES AND FINANCING PLAN**  
**(\$'000)**

<b>Item</b>	<b>Amount</b>
<b>Asian Development Bank<sup>a</sup></b>	
1. Consultants	
a. Remuneration and per diem	
i. International consultants	266.7
ii. National consultants	110.0
b. International and local travel	30.0
c. Reports and communication	50.0
2. Training, seminars, and conferences	14.0
3. Surveys	9.3
4. Miscellaneous administration and support costs <sup>b</sup>	10.0
5. Contingencies	10.0
<b>Total</b>	<b>500.0</b>

<sup>a</sup> Financed by the Asian Development Bank's Technical Assistance Special Fund (TASF-Others).

<sup>b</sup> The resources allocated to miscellaneous administration will be used in compliance with ADB (Budget, Personnel, and Management Systems Department; and Strategy and Policy Department). 2013. Use of Bank Resources: Regional Technical Assistance and Technical Assistance vs Internal Administrative Expenses Budget. Memorandum. 26 June (internal).

Source: Asian Development Bank estimates.

## OUTLINE TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR CONSULTANTS

1. The outline of terms of reference for the regional capacity development technical assistance (TA) consultants is described below. Inputs from four international (15 person-months) and various national (25 person-months) consultants will be required to prepare an assessment and initiate the activities. The following international specialists are required: (i) team leader and food safety specialist, (ii) food safety technical regulation specialist, (iii) food safety laboratory inspection specialist, and (iv) food safety network development specialist. The team leader shall have proven management skills as a team leader and technical knowledge on food safety management systems. The other international consultants preferably shall have postgraduate degrees in a related field with 10 years of demonstrated experience in developed and developing countries. The national consultants shall preferably have a postgraduate degree with proven experience working in development projects in their area of expertise.

2. The quality- and cost-based selection method with a quality–cost ratio of 90:10 and simplified technical proposals will be used to recruit an international consultancy firm in accordance with the Asian Development Bank (ADB) Guidelines on the Use of Consultants (2013, as amended from time to time). The consultants will support training, workshops, and regional networking activities in their area of expertise. The team leader will oversee all TA activities and report to the ADB task manager. The reporting requirements will include inception, midterm, and final reports. The consultants and resource persons will assist ADB in disseminating best practices and supporting high-level policy dialogue.

### A. International Consultants

3. **Team leader and food safety specialist** (5 person-months). The consultant shall perform the following functions:

- (i) lead and develop a detailed plan of TA activities, such as team mobilization, planning of field work, training, workshops, and timeline for accomplishing key tasks; guide the team's communication; and consult with participating sanitary and phytosanitary (SPS) agencies and border points in CAREC<sup>1</sup> member countries (CMCs);
- (ii) liaise with international technical agencies and development partners active in food safety matters in CMCs and internationally;
- (iii) prepare reports and conduct training in risk analysis and development of risk-based inspection of both domestic and imported products;
- (iv) lead and coordinate in-country and regional training and workshops;
- (v) prepare TA inception, midterm, and final reports in conformity with ADB procedures and standards.
- (vi) develop the methodology for four outputs in compliance with international food safety standards;
- (vii) ensure that regulations and systems proposed are not in conflict with CMCs' commitments to other food safety standards, such as those of the European Union (EU) and Eurasian Economic Union;
- (viii) develop a framework for establishing a national food safety unit consisting of government and private sector representatives;
- (ix) link the national food safety unit with regional and global networks;

---

<sup>1</sup> CAREC refers to the Central Asian Regional Economic Cooperation.

- (x) identify agencies to set food safety standard regulations and another, certificate-issuing agency with a mandate to verify compliance;
- (xi) develop training, study tours, and workshop programs; and identify and coordinate with resource persons; and
- (xii) develop knowledge products based on TA findings, success stories, and best practices.

4. **Food safety technical regulation specialist** (5 person-months). The specialist shall perform the following:

- (i) conduct needs assessment to identify gaps in regulations and strategies to be developed;
- (ii) develop and/or modify food safety laws and strategies;
- (iii) identify areas of international food safety standards that differ from EU and European Economic Union food safety standards; and
- (iv) develop and support action plans for the implementation of international food safety standards.

5. **Food safety laboratory inspection specialist** (2.5 person-months). The specialist shall carry out these tasks:

- (i) develop a cost estimate (i.e., annual operational and fixed costs) for upgrading infrastructure at national and regional laboratories; and
- (ii) prepare a financing plan for fully functional different laboratories and border inspection laboratory.

6. **Food safety network development specialist** (2.5 person-months). The specialist shall perform the following:

- (i) develop a framework for the CAREC food safety network in coordination with the national food safety units;
- (ii) develop a CAREC food safety network based on best practices of the EU and Association of Southeast Asian Nations food safety networks; and
- (iii) provide technical support for regional training, workshops, and seminars.

## **B. National Consultants**

7. The national consultants will support the consulting team in compiling national and regional documents on food safety policies and institutional responsibilities, regulatory framework, laboratory facilities, and infrastructure; and collect information on other areas requested by the team of consultants. They will help organize training sessions and workshops, and coordinate with ADB resident missions and government agencies. They will report to the team leader.

8. The consultancy firm recruited in 2017 may continue implementing the additional TA indicated activities if its performance has been satisfactory. Upon approval of additional financing, inputs from the following consultants will be required: (i) team leader and food safety specialist (15 person-months), (ii) food safety technical regulation specialist (10 person-months), (iii) food safety laboratory inspection specialist (2 person-months), and (iv) food safety network development specialist (2 person-months). The other consultants needed to continue TA implementation are indicated below.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup> Subject to required procedures and approvals, ADB plans to secure additional financing in the amount of \$1.5 million to support the achievement of the outcome in the TA.

9. **Food safety specialist for agricultural value chains** (10 person-months). The consultant shall perform the following functions:

- (i) conduct a needs assessment and develop a framework and action plan to institutionalize international food safety standards in domestic systems, and to facilitate international trade for groups 1 and 2 countries; and
- (ii) train value chain operators and inspectors from participating CMCs for implementation of good hygienic practices and hazard analysis and critical control point.

#### C. **National and/or Regional Consultants (85 person-months)**

10. The national and/or regional consultants will support the consulting team in compiling national and regional documents (on food safety policies and institutional responsibilities, regulatory framework, laboratory facilities, and infrastructure) and in collecting information on other areas requested by the consulting team. They will also help organize training sessions and workshops, and coordinate with ADB resident missions and government agencies. They will report to the team leader.

#### D. **International and/or Regional Consultants, and Resource Persons**

11. **Food safety development specialist** (international, 18 person-months). Several individual consultants may be recruited to develop food safety-related investment projects if requests are made by the governments of CMCs. The investment projects will be based on the findings of the TA, and terms of reference shall be developed as required expertise is identified.

12. **Consultant requirements unallocated** (international, 10 person-months). The services will be used to conduct special studies that the TA implementing agency and/or the project team deems necessary during the implementation of TA.

13. **Website manager** (regional, 6 person-months). Under the direct supervision of the food safety network development specialist, the consultant will be responsible for the following specific tasks:

- (i) design and manage technical functions related to the CAREC food safety network, including updating and linking all website pages in English and Russian;
- (ii) identify material in publications and use it to produce animated interfaces to display a wide variety of information, and illustrate and produce educational animations; and
- (iii) implement and maintain the technical requirements of the web systems.

14. **Resource persons** (international and regional experts, 80 person-days). The experts from specialist agencies will be recruited as needed to tap specific expertise. The terms of reference will be developed once the expertise requirements are identified. The resource persons will be recruited mainly for training, workshops, and tasks requiring specific expertise.