

The logo for the Asian Development Bank (ADB), consisting of the letters 'ADB' in a white serif font inside a black square.

Technical Assistance Report

Project Number: 50324-001
Knowledge and Support Technical Assistance (KSTA)
August 2017

Enhancing Operational Results Delivery

This document is being disclosed to the public in accordance with ADB's Public Communications Policy 2011.

Asian Development Bank

ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	–	Asian Development Bank
DEfR	–	development effectiveness review
DMC	–	developing member country
DMF	–	design and monitoring framework
GDI	–	Global Delivery Initiative
MDB	–	multilateral development bank
SDCC-KS	–	Sustainable Development and Climate Change Department, Knowledge Sharing and Services Center
SPD	–	Strategy, Policy and Review Department
SPRA	–	SPD, Results Management and Aid Effectiveness Division
TA	–	technical assistance
TWD	–	<i>Together We Deliver</i>

NOTE

In this report, "\$" refers to US dollars.

<p>Director General</p> <p>Deputy Director General</p> <p>Director</p> <p>Team leader</p> <p>Team members</p>	<p>I. Bhushan, Strategy, Policy and Review Department (SPD)</p> <p>T. Kimura, SPD</p> <p>B. Woods, Results Management and Aid Effectiveness Division, SPD</p> <p>A. Andrysiak, Senior Results Management Specialist, SPD</p> <p>A. Almelor, Results Management Assistant, SPD</p> <p>J. Asanova, Principal Results Management Specialist, SPD</p> <p>C. Caranto, Results Management Analyst, SPD</p> <p>A. Cortez, Associate Results Management Officer, SPD</p> <p>M. Dimaano, Results Management Assistant, SPD</p> <p>M. Domingo-Morales, Results Management Officer, SPD</p> <p>V. Francisco, Results Management Officer, SPD</p> <p>Y. Ikeda, Results Management Specialist, SPD</p> <p>N. Lu, Senior Results Management Officer, SPD</p> <p>S. Nakhooda, Senior Results Management Specialist, SPD</p> <p>A. Nicolas, Results Management Analyst, SPD</p> <p>A. Sunico-Bautista, Results Management Assistant, SPD</p>
---	---

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

CONTENTS

	Page
KNOWLEDGE AND SUPPORT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AT A GLANCE	
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. ISSUES	1
III. THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE	3
A. Impact and Outcome	3
B. Outputs, Methods, and Activities	3
C. Cost and Financing	4
D. Implementation Arrangements	4
IV. THE PRESIDENT'S DECISION	5
APPENDIXES	
1. Design and Monitoring Framework	6
2. Cost Estimates and Financing Plan	9
3. List of Linked Documents	10

KNOWLEDGE AND SUPPORT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AT A GLANCE

1. Basic Data		Project Number: 50324-001	
Project Name	Enhancing Operational Results Delivery	Department /Division	SPD/SPRA
Nature of Activity	Capacity Development	Executing Agency	Asian Development Bank
Modality	Regional		
Country	REG		
2. Sector		ADB Financing (\$ million)	
✓ Public sector management	Subsector(s) Public administration		0.75
		Total	0.75
3. Strategic Agenda		Climate Change Information	
Inclusive economic growth (IEG)	Subcomponents Pillar 2: Access to economic opportunities, including jobs, made more inclusive	Climate Change impact on the Project	Low
4. Drivers of Change		Gender Equity and Mainstreaming	
Governance and capacity development (GCD)	Components Organizational development	Effective gender mainstreaming (EGM)	✓
Knowledge solutions (KNS)	Knowledge sharing activities		
5. Poverty and SDG Targeting		Location Impact	
Geographic Targeting	No	Regional	High
Household Targeting	No		
SDG Targeting	Yes		
SDG Goals	SDG17		
6. Risk Categorization		Low	
7. Safeguard Categorization		Safeguard Policy Statement does not apply	
8. Financing			
Modality and Sources		Amount (\$ million)	
ADB		0.75	
Knowledge and Support technical assistance: Technical Assistance Special Fund		0.75	
Cofinancing		0.00	
None		0.00	
Counterpart		0.00	
None		0.00	
Total		0.75	

I. INTRODUCTION

1. The Asian Development Bank (ADB) supports developing member countries (DMCs) to achieve development results through three interlinked assistance levels: country, sector or theme, and project. At the country and sector levels, ADB integrates results frameworks in country partnership strategies to help ensure that country operations achieve the intended development outcomes. Sectors and themes have operational plans containing results frameworks that set out desired achievements across DMCs. At the project level, ADB uses the design and monitoring framework (DMF) to assist DMCs—particularly executing and implementing agencies of ADB-supported projects—in results-based project design and management. ADB also measures its corporate performance through its annual development effectiveness reviews (DEfRs), which report achievements and identify weaknesses in ADB’s operational and organizational management.

2. ADB needs to continue to improve its results delivery.¹ The proposed technical assistance (TA) will (i) establish a holistic approach to results-based project design training in DMCs, including face-to-face training sessions and online learning modules; (ii) support operational research in issues that affect the delivery of desired project outputs and outcomes; (iii) disseminate lessons that can be used to improve project design and delivery; (iv) expand efforts to capture the transformation that ADB operations produce at the beneficiary level; and (v) support collaborative work with other multilateral development banks (MDBs), including on benchmarking the performance of MDBs through the Common Performance Assessment System report.²

3. ADB approved a concept paper for this TA on 20 October 2016 as part of the 2017 TA program.³ This TA’s outputs are in the management-approved 2017 work program of the Strategy, Policy and Review Department (SPD), and the TA is in the 2017 work plan of the SPD’s Results Management and Aid Effectiveness Division (SPRA). The DMF is in Appendix 1.

II. ISSUES

4. While ADB operations have benefited from the use of results-based approaches, the annual DEfRs still show recurring problem areas that need attention and corrective actions. The 2016 DEfR noted that while the success rate of sovereign operations improved considerably, it remains below the 2016 target of 80%, and the success rates of nonsovereign operations remain stagnant. And while the delivery of gender equality results through completed operations is strong, gender mainstreaming at approval has declined since 2014. Other key indicators of inclusiveness in design also show weaknesses, including social protection operations supported through the Asian Development Fund and infrastructure operations targeting lagging areas.

5. Operations fall short of expectations because of challenges at various stages in the project cycle. Starting from the project design stage, the project DMF should clearly present the results chain and identify plausible risks. The quality of DMFs and their link to the problem tree and the rationale could be further strengthened. Part of the challenge can be traced to weak ownership by DMC staff on the project design, owing to a lack of experience and familiarity with the results chain. The issue is further compounded by turnover in executing agencies and implementing agencies without adequate handover. To address the problem, ADB must periodically build the

¹ ADB. 2014. *Technical Assistance for Enhancing Results Delivery in Operations*. Manila; and ADB. 2015. *Technical Assistance for Enhancing Results Delivery in Operations II*. Manila.

² Managing for Development Results. Common Performance Assessment System—COMPAS. <http://www.mfdr.org/Compas/index.html>

³ The TA first appeared in the business opportunities section of ADB’s website on 30 June 2017.

capacity of executing and implementing agency staff on sound, results-based project design. Training provided to DMC staff under previous TA projects directly responded to demand from executing and implementing agencies, which was communicated through ADB's regional departments and resident missions. This demand has grown in recent times, and additional efforts are required to respond to it.

6. During 2015–2016, ADB conducted the first in a series of operational research studies. This first study concentrated on the sustainability of ADB's road transport and water operations, which previous DEFs had identified as a key challenge. The study identified good practices and lessons learned from a sample of ongoing and completed ADB projects to help determine long-term sustainability. ADB circulated a draft of the study for comments during 2016 and is expected to publish the study in 2017.⁴ Other smaller studies conducted as part of the operational research included an analysis of (i) factors affecting projects and the results-based lending disbursement ratio, and (ii) key factors affecting contract awards; the analysis identified important lessons for ADB and DMCs. The initial studies covered a portion of a broader set of challenges that development projects face. To improve results delivery of operations, ADB must undertake additional research and look at issues affecting ADB's completed operations. It can also learn from the experience of comparable organizations. The World Bank, for example, has invested significant resources to develop a taxonomy of development challenges under its Global Delivery Initiative (GDI), of which ADB is a member.⁵ Operations research, including greater alignment with the GDI, can help ADB and DMCs improve learning from projects and incorporate lessons learned into design and implementation, thus improving success rates. Case studies based on ADB operations can also help DMCs learn from ADB's experience and improve their own projects.

7. Understanding and communicating the effect ADB operations have on the individual lives of beneficiaries is a crucial part of enhancing development efforts in DMCs. Greater awareness by all stakeholders of the difference that ADB projects make builds support for development in DMCs and the wider global community. In addition, this knowledge can further improve design and delivery through the learning process. *Together We Deliver* (TWD), a collection of individual stories of people's lives changed by successful projects, demonstrates the benefits that ADB projects bring.⁶ ADB's stakeholder representatives and donors have endorsed the presentation of these human stories, have communicated strong demand for such products, and are supportive of expanding coverage of more areas of ADB's operational and strategic priorities. However, the learning element of this publication could be strengthened by documenting the lives of beneficiaries before and after projects. In addition, the coverage could be deepened to increase awareness of the benefits of projects of different types across the range of sectors, themes, and partnerships. The sustainability of benefits also needs to be explored.

8. To sustain achievements under previous TA projects, it is crucial to provide additional resources to replicate capacity building and outreach on a wider scale (footnote 1). Under the proposed TA, ADB will (i) extend project DMF training to more DMCs, (ii) expand its operational research, and (iii) expand and enhance the production of human stories linked to operations.

⁴ ADB. Forthcoming. *ADB Reflects*. Manila.

⁵ Global Delivery Initiative. <http://globaldeliveryinitiative.org>. The GDI is a broad, multi-organizational program that helps practitioners prepare for and address delivery challenges. The World Bank Group hosts the GDI Secretariat.

⁶ To date, ADB has published three issues of TWD: ADB. 2014. *Together We Deliver: 10 Stories from ADB-Supported Projects with Clear Development Impacts*. Manila; ADB. 2015. *Together We Deliver 2014: From Knowledge and Partnerships to Results*. Manila; and ADB. 2016. *Together We Deliver 2015: Partnerships against Poverty*. Manila.

III. THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

A. Impact and Outcome

9. The TA is aligned with the following impact: effective and sustainable delivery of development results in DMCs increased. The TA will have the following outcome: quality of project design and implementation improved.

B. Outputs, Methods, and Activities

10. **Output 1: Capacity in preparing design and monitoring frameworks developed.** The proposed TA will establish a holistic approach to DMF training. The training program will include two components: (i) face-to-face training sessions, and (ii) online learning modules. Classroom-based training can effectively catalyze the use of results-based thinking. The courses will provide participants from executing and implementing agencies (at least 50% of whom are female staff members of the agencies) with practical applications of the results chain under ADB's various lending modalities, including policy-based lending, results-based lending, and multitranche financing facilities. Crosscutting issues such as gender equality, governance, climate change adaptation, and inclusiveness will be key features of the training program. To overcome logistical and resource constraints and reach out to more participants, ADB will develop online learning courses that cater to different knowledge levels, which will provide on-demand learning opportunities. ADB will develop the modules in collaboration with the Sustainable Development and Climate Change Department, Knowledge Sharing and Services Center (SDCC-KS).

11. **Output 2: Lessons from operations documented and disseminated.** The proposed TA will continue to support operational research started under previous small-scale TA projects. The studies will research issues affecting operations, which were determined in part by the DEFIR findings. This will include research on topics suggested by ADB's regional departments and sector and thematic groups, such as the use of ADB projects as pilots for replication by DMCs, and the lessons on creating and sharing knowledge through ADB projects. Research will also cover inclusiveness dimensions of ADB operations such as gender equality and other topics; and will build on other ADB studies, reviews of operational plans, and lessons from evaluations by the Independent Evaluation Department. SPRA will collaborate with ADB's operations departments, sector and thematic groups, and SDCC-KS; and will consult with ADB's Independent Evaluation Department to identify delivery and results achievement challenges that would benefit from research and learning. SPRA will collaborate with development partners such as the Korea Development Institute and Shanghai International Program for Development Evaluation Training, while ADB will increase alignment with the World Bank's GDI. ADB will complete a series of operations research studies and will synthesize and share the knowledge gained from these studies across ADB and with DMC partners, using appropriate channels. Linkages with respect to data mining, for example, will include collaboration with ADB's Operations Services and Financial Management Department and Office of Information Systems and Technology, among others.

12. **Output 3: Developing member country experiences documented and disseminated.** The proposed TA will support the production of at least two issues of results stories that feature the positive changes brought about by ADB operations in DMCs. These stories will include inclusiveness dimensions of operations. In particular, the gender aspects of operations will be captured by a systematic collection of information on gender-differential outcome results at the data collection stage and highlighted in the stories. Greater linkage to ADB's efforts in impact evaluation will also be sought, and pre- and post- data collection will be undertaken by embedding

TWD in the design process of operations prior to approval. This will be done in collaboration with ADB's operations departments, sector and thematic groups, and Economic Research and Regional Coordination Department. In collaboration with its Department of External Relations, ADB will also consider producing associated multimedia content for TWD, which may include interactive media, virtual reality content, online articles, and social media posts.

13. Output 4: Multilateral development bank performance benchmarked and disseminated. The proposed TA will support collaborative work with MDBs, with emphasis on benchmarking performance and using evidence-based approaches to measure performance. In 2017, ADB took over the secretariat and coordination functions of the MDB Managing for Development Results working group. ADB will lead the preparation of the Common Performance Assessment System report, which benchmarks members' progress in achieving development results (footnote 2).

C. Cost and Financing

14. The TA is estimated to cost \$750,000, which will be financed on a grant basis by ADB's Technical Assistance Special Fund (TASF-other sources). The key expenditure items are listed in Appendix 2. The TA will cover the travel cost of ADB staff acting as resource persons for seminars and workshops.

15. The governments of participating DMCs will make relevant country data available; will nominate participants to join training courses and meetings related to this TA; will validate TA deliverables, such as country and progress reports; and may provide in-kind contributions.

D. Implementation Arrangements

16. ADB will be the executing agency of the TA. SPD will administer and implement the TA from September 2017 to March 2020 and will closely coordinate implementation with ADB's operational departments, sector and thematic groups, SDCC-KS, and other departments. The TA will (i) support the development of DMF learning modules, help deliver online and face-to-face training, and build capacity in results-based project design; (ii) support operations research to probe issues that constrain the effectiveness of ADB projects and disseminate findings to improve project design; (iii) document and disseminate the changes contributed by ADB operations to people's lives; and (iv) support the benchmarking and dissemination of MDB performance.

17. The TA will disseminate knowledge through various platforms. To ensure continuous learning on DMF principles, online courses will be developed to supplement the on-site training conducted by DMF resource persons. These courses may be hosted on existing ADB platforms for online learning to ensure that they remain accessible even after the TA closes. For operational research products and TWD, in collaboration with the Department of External Relations, the outputs will be disseminated through various channels, depending on the target audience. All outputs will be made available to the public for free through ADB's corporate website. Limited copies will be produced for general dissemination and targeted workshops in headquarters, representative offices, and resident missions.

18. The TA will require 100 person-months of consulting services comprising 38 person-months for international consultants and 62 person-months for national consultants. The TA will require consultant inputs to prepare and deliver a DMF training program, including online training modules. Researchers and data analysts will conduct operations research, and writers will draft

the manuscripts for various knowledge products. The TA will also recruit resource persons and/or experts to support the training program and outreach activities.

Implementation Arrangements

Aspects	Arrangements	
Indicative implementation period	September 2017–March 2020	
Executing agency	ADB's Strategy, Policy, and Review Department in collaboration with operations, advisory, and knowledge departments	
Consultants	To be selected and engaged by ADB	
	Individual consultants selection	100 person-months
Procurement	To be procured by ADB	
	Not applicable	
Advance contracting and retroactive financing	Not applicable	
Disbursement	The TA resources will be disbursed following ADB's <i>Technical Assistance Disbursement Handbook</i> (2010, as amended from time to time)	
Asset turnover or disposal arrangement upon TA completion	Not applicable	

ADB= Asian Development Bank, TA= technical assistance.

Source: ADB estimates.

19. **Consulting services.** The terms of reference for consultants are accessible from the list of linked documents in Appendix 3.⁷ The consultants will be engaged by ADB in accordance with the Guidelines on the Use of Consultants (2013, as amended from time to time). Disbursements will follow ADB's *Technical Assistance Disbursement Handbook* (2010, as amended from time to time).

20. **Online learning.** To continue accessibility of the learning courses beyond the TA completion date, SPRA will explore hosting the proposed e-learning courses within the learning management system maintained by SDCC-KS. ADB makes learning courses on select development topics available to external participants on its k-Learn and Development Asia websites. The sites provide online courses on various sector and thematic areas as part of ADB's work to share knowledge in the region. SPD will work with SDCC-KS's team of e-learning specialists to update and manage the content of the courses.

IV. THE PRESIDENT'S DECISION

21. The President, acting under the authority delegated by the Board, has approved the provision of technical assistance not exceeding the equivalent of \$750,000 on a grant basis for Enhancing Operational Results Delivery, and hereby reports this action to the Board.

⁷ Terms of Reference for Consultants (accessible from the list of linked documents in Appendix 3).

Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Data Sources and Reporting	Risks
<p>3. DMC experiences documented and disseminated</p> <p>4. MDB performance benchmarked and disseminated</p>	<p>3a. At least two new TWD issues completed (2017 baseline: 0)</p> <p>3b. Number of interactions on ADB's social media platforms increased to 30,000 per year by December 2018 (2016 baseline: 23,800 interactions^b)</p> <p>3c. Share of TWD stories that feature gender equality or women maintained or increased (2016 baseline: 36%)</p> <p>4a. At least one new COMPAS report produced and published (2016 baseline: 0)</p>	<p>3a. TWD issues</p> <p>3b. Annual ADB website statistics, ADB's Twitter channel, ADB's Facebook page</p> <p>3c. ADB progress reports, TWD issues</p> <p>4a. Annual progress reports</p>	
<p>Key Activities with Milestones</p> <p>1. Capacity in preparing DMFs developed</p> <p>1.1. Conduct needs assessment and functionality analysis for intermediate and advanced classroom-based and e-learning training modules (September–December 2017)</p> <p>1.2. Develop content for e-learning modules (September–November 2017)</p> <p>1.3. Develop and/or update an online learning website for DMFs (September 2017–March 2018)</p> <p>1.4. Pilot test intermediate and advanced classroom and e-learning courses and finalize them (December 2017–October 2018)</p> <p>1.5. Launch the revised intermediate and advanced online courses (November 2018–October 2019)</p> <p>1.6. Conduct tracer studies to track improved DMF formulation among course participants (July 2018–October 2019)</p> <p>2. Lessons from operations documented and disseminated</p> <p>2.1. Identify topics for the studies based on DEfR findings and ADB Management discussions (July–August 2018)</p> <p>2.2. Engage international and national consultants and resource persons (August 2018)</p> <p>2.3. Conduct the studies (August–December 2018)</p> <p>2.4. Consult within ADB and with selected DMCs on studies' findings and recommendations (January–February 2019)</p> <p>2.5. Publish operational research series (June 2019)</p> <p>2.6. Disseminate findings and recommend improvements to ADB business processes (July–December 2019)</p> <p>3. DMC experiences documented and disseminated</p> <p>3.1. Coordinate with DMCs and ADB operations departments on the selection of projects and gather project data, including interviews with stakeholders (December–May of each publication year of TWD)</p> <p>3.2. Write, edit, and produce stories for publication in both print and electronic formats (May–July of each publication year of TWD)</p> <p>3.3. Produce and present a book to ADB stakeholders and the general public (August–November of each publication year)</p> <p>3.4. Disseminate project success stories (August–November of each publication year)</p>			

<p>4. MDB performance benchmarked and disseminated</p> <p>4.1. MDB Managing for Development Results working group endorses the COMPAS report</p> <p>4.2. Prepare and publish COMPAS report (2019)</p> <p>4.3. Produce and endorse summary of agreements on collaboration among MDB Managing for Development Results working group members</p>
<p>Inputs</p> <p>ADB: \$ 750,000 (grant)</p>
<p>Assumptions for Partner Financing</p> <p>Not applicable</p>

ADB = Asian Development Bank, COMPAS = Common Performance Assessment System, DEfR = development effectiveness review, DMC = developing member country, DMF = design and monitoring framework, MDB = multilateral development bank, TA = technical assistance, TWD = *Together We Deliver*.

^a Defined by TA.

^b Interactions include likes, shares, retweets, and comments on ADB's social media platforms.

Source: ADB.

COST ESTIMATES AND FINANCING PLAN
(\$'000)

Item	Amount
Asian Development Bank^a	
1. Consultants	
a. Remuneration and per diem	
i. International consultants	320.0
ii. National consultants	140.0
2. Printed external publications	12.0
3. Training, seminars, workshops, forums, and conferences ^b	163.0
4. Miscellaneous administration and support costs ^c	40.0
5. Contingencies	75.0
Total	750.0

ADB = Asian Development Bank, TA = technical assistance.

Note: The TA is estimated to cost \$750,000, of which contributions from the Asian Development Bank are presented in the table above. The detailed breakdown of the disbursement categories is for estimate purposes only.

^a Financed by the Asian Development Bank's Technical Assistance Special Fund (TASF—other sources).

^b Includes costs of facilitators, travel costs of ADB staff acting as resource persons, rental costs for venues and related facilities, travel costs of participants, and costs for translation and interpreter services.

^c ADB (Budget, Personnel, and Management Systems Department; and Strategy, Policy and Review Department). 2013. Use of Bank Resources: Regional Technical Assistance and Technical Assistance vs. Internal Administrative Expenses Budget. Memorandum. 26 June.

Source: ADB estimates.

LIST OF LINKED DOCUMENTS

<http://www.adb.org/Documents/LinkedDocs/?id=50324-001-TARreport>

1. Terms of Reference for Consultants

Supplementary Document

2. Together We Deliver 2018 and 2019 Estimated Printing and Shipping Cost