



Completion Report

PUBLIC

Project Number: 50364-001
Technical Assistance Cluster Number: 0026
August 2022

Deepening Civil Society Engagement for Development Effectiveness

This document is being disclosed to the public in accordance with ADB's Access to Information Policy.

Asian Development Bank

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

TA Cluster Number, Country, and Name: TA 0026-REG: Deepening Civil Society Engagement for Development Effectiveness		Amount Approved: \$1,400,000 Revised Amount: Not applicable	
Executing Agency: Asian Development Bank	Source of Funding: Technical Assistance Special Fund (TASF 6 and Other Sources)	Amount Undisbursed: \$55,901.04	Amount Used: \$1,344,098.96
TA Approval Date: 27 November 2017	TA Signing Date: 27 November 2017	TA Completion Date	
		Original Date: 30 September 2021	Latest Revised Date: 31 March 2022
		Financial Closing Date: 30 June 2022	Number of Extensions: 2
TA Type: Knowledge and support TA	Nature of Activity: Capacity development	TA Arrangement: Cluster, Regional	

Description¹

In early 2016, the NGO and Civil Society Center (NGOC) reviewed the state of civil society organization (CSO) engagement in Asian Development Bank (ADB) policies and operations in light of global and regional trends, as well as the changing role of civil society in poverty reduction and sustainable development.² Lessons from previous civil society engagements concluded that deeper CSO participation would improve development outcomes and increase the inclusiveness of programs and projects.

The knowledge and support technical assistance (TA) cluster was implemented through three subprojects that supported developing member countries (DMCs) Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) commitments, as well as the creation of partnerships between civil society and development partners to strengthen overall effectiveness.

The cluster comprised three subprojects: (i) Deepening ADB-Civil Society Engagement in Selected Countries in Central and West Asia, East Asia, and the Pacific (TA 9475, approved on 20 December 2017),³ (ii) Deepening ADB-Civil Society Engagement in Selected Countries in Southeast and South Asia (TA 9592, approved on 19 September 2018),⁴ and (iii) Deepening Civil Society Engagement in ADB Operations (TA 9769, approved on 18 July 2019).⁵ Subproject 1 focused on capacity building for CSOs and governments; Subproject 2 supported civil society engagement in the Graduation approach in the Philippines and India; and Subproject 3 tapped into CSO expertise to complement ongoing ADB projects in Central and West Asia.

Expected Impact, Outcome, and Outputs

The TA's expected impact is delivery of inclusive development services in selected DMCs improved (SDG 10). The TA's outcome was CSO participation in ADB operations strengthened. The TA was expected to deliver the following outputs: (i) capacity for effective civil society organization engagement in the design, implementation, and monitoring of ADB projects improved; (ii) demonstration activities through effective civil society organization engagement conducted; and (iii) knowledge products about effective CSO engagement in ADB operations generated and shared.

Implementation Arrangements

TA activities and milestone events were conducted as planned by ADB staff and consultants from 2017–2022. The total TA amount for the three subprojects was \$1,400,000 of which \$1,344,098.96 was used. The remaining \$55,901.04

¹ ADB. 2017. [Technical Assistance to the Deepening Civil Society Engagement for Development Effectiveness](#). Manila.

² ADB. 2016. [Proposed Strategic Directions for ADB–CSO Engagement, 2016–2030: A Discussion Note. Consultant's report. Manila \(SC 106166-REG\)](#). Manila.

³ ADB. 2017. [TA Subproject Proposal to the Deepening ADB-Civil Society Engagement in Selected Countries in Central and West Asia, East Asia, and the Pacific \(Subproject 1\)](#). Manila.

⁴ ADB. 2018. [Technical Assistance for Deepening Civil Society Engagement for Development Effectiveness - Deepening ADB–Civil Society Engagement in Selected Countries in Southeast and South Asia \(Subproject 2\)](#). Manila.

⁵ ADB. 2019. [Technical Assistance for Regional: Deepening Civil Society Engagement for Development Effectiveness–Deepening Civil Society Engagement in ADB Operations \(Subproject 3\)](#). Manila.

was the result of cost savings from various activities under the TA. ADB administered the TA and was the executing agency. NGOC, under the Thematic Advisory Service Cluster of ADB's Sustainable Development and Climate Change Department, implemented and completed the activities

The TA was implemented as planned within the TA report with a total of 16 person-months of international and 39 person-months of national individual consultants. 1 person-month of international and 136 person-months of national firm consultants supported the TA activities. These included CSOs contracted to conduct research (e.g., BRAC USA) and field work (e.g., BRAC Philippines, World Vision India), individual consultants engaged to conduct research (e.g., South Asia Department report, CSO Sourcebook), national consultants to conduct research (e.g., civil society briefs), and resource persons to support ADB operations (e.g., transport projects in Uzbekistan). All consultants were engaged following ADB's Guidelines on the Use of Consultants. Under Subproject 2 (TA9592) some livelihood assets were procured (e.g., food carts, poultry and farm implements) in accordance with ADB's Procurement Policy (2017, as amended from time to time).

The original completion date, 30 September 2021, was extended twice. The extensions – from 30 September 2021 to 31 December 2021 and from 31 December 2021 to 31 March 2022 – were due to delays in resettlement design and project consultations for the Tamil Nadu Inclusive Resilient and Sustainable Housing for Urban Poor Sector Project and the delay in completion of activities by CSO partners due to the coronavirus disease (COVID-19) pandemic.

Conduct of Activities

Overall, the TA demonstrated strong development results by piloting new, operationally relevant approaches at ADB that will provide a foundation for future civil society work.

Subproject 1 under the TA focused on CSO participation in selected countries across three regional departments: Central and West Asia Department (CWRD), East Asia Department (EARD), and Pacific Department (PARD). Activities under Subproject 1 built the foundation for effective, meaningful CSO engagement across ADB through a broad array of capacity building activities and engagement work, which was expanded upon in Subprojects 2 and 3. Baseline assessments of CSO engagement in Mongolia and Georgia indicated a need for both DMC and CSO capacity building in civil society engagement, which reflects circumstances in other DMCs. Informed by these initial assessments, Subproject 1 activities included: (1) Skills training for executing and implementing agencies in Georgia (December 2018), Mongolia (September 2018), the Solomon Islands (July 2018), and Papua New Guinea (PNG) (July 2018); (2) training and capacity building workshops for CSOs for Georgia, Mongolia, and Pacific DMCs; (3) development of e-learning modules on CSO engagement, which were tailored to country specific needs and translated into Mongolian;⁶ (4) creation of Country Cooperation Assessments and Action Plans for Georgia and Mongolia; (5) development of the Participation Tools for the Pacific;⁷ (6) drafting of a participation plan for Mongolia and the Solomon Islands; (7) the establishment of civil society Country Advisory Committees in Mongolia and Georgia; (8) operational support to (i) Georgia: North-South Corridor (Kvesheti-Kobi) Road Project;⁸ (ii) Mongolia: Improving Transport Services in Ger Areas;⁹ (iii) PNG: Rural Primary Health Services Delivery Project;¹⁰ (iv) Solomon Islands: Urban Water Supply and Sanitation Project;¹¹ (v) Kiribati: South Tarawa Water Supply Project;¹² (9) a mapping of CSOs in Uzbekistan; (10) civil society briefs for Mongolia, Georgia, and Timor Leste, and (11) the financing of a dedicated staff consultant on an intermittent basis at ADB's Mongolia Resident Mission (MNRM). Operational support included activities such as mappings of CSOs within project areas, organization of consultations with CSOs, support for consultants, and capacity building and awareness raising. The success of the inclusion of meaningful CSO engagement in this diverse portfolio of projects energized the processing of the subsequent subprojects under the TA, which were driven by regional department demand.

Subproject 2 expanded the TA's focus to South and Southeast Asia. In South Asia, the TA consolidated its planned CSO engagement into one flagship investment - the Tamil Nadu Inclusive, Resilient and Sustainable Housing for the Urban Poor Project.¹³ In Southeast Asia, the TA provided funding for a third treatment arm of the Graduation approach at the request of the Philippines Department of Labor and Employment, as well as for the Indonesian Civil Society Advisory Group, which informed Indonesia's country partnership strategy development. The TA also supported the

⁶ ADB. eLearn. [Deepening Civil Society Engagement for Better Development Results for ADB Staff](#). Manila.

⁷ ADB. 2019. [Participation Tools for the Pacific - Part 1: Engaging Pacific Civil Society Organizations | Development Asia](#).

⁸ ADB. 2019. [Georgia: North-South Corridor \(Kvesheti-Kobi\) Road Project](#). Manila.

⁹ ADB. 2019. [Mongolia: Improving Transport Services in Ger Areas](#). Manila.

¹⁰ ADB. 2011. [Papua New Guinea: Rural Primary Health Services Delivery Project](#). Manila.

¹¹ ADB. 2019. [Solomon Islands: Urban Water Supply and Sanitation Sector Project](#). Manila.

¹² ADB. 2019. [Kiribati: South Tarawa Water Supply Project](#). Manila.

¹³ ADB. 2021. [India: Inclusive, Resilient, and Sustainable Housing for Urban Poor Sector Project in Tamil Nadu](#). Manila.

publication of the CSO Sourcebook, which built upon newly revised institutional documents. It also funded, a high-level event on the successes of the Graduation approach in poverty alleviation.¹⁴ Subproject 2 activities included: (1) the Graduation approach designed and launched in Tamil Nadu for the Inclusive, Resilient and Sustainable Housing for the Urban Poor Project, (2) the Graduation pilot approach in the Philippines, targeting support for 1,800 beneficiaries,¹⁵ (3) the publication of the CSO Sourcebook,¹⁶ (4) workshops, including the high-level event on Social Protection for Economic Inclusion: Adapting the Graduation Approach in Asia and the Pacific which was opened by Nobel prize winning laureate Dr. Abhijit Banerjee,¹⁷ (5) the preparation of a report analyzing CSO engagement in SARD,¹⁸ (6) the authoring of a civil society brief for India,¹⁹ (7) support for the civil society advisory group in Indonesia, and (8) funding for a civil society expert in SARD to support due diligence for CSO engagement. Findings from the poverty reduction impacts of the pilot in the Philippines have gone on to inform flagship ADB projects, such as the Malolos-Clark Railway Project.²⁰

Subproject 3 expanded civil society engagement in Central West Asia by using a demand-driven approach with ADB's operational departments to identify six projects where civil society engagement could provide added value in Georgia, Armenia, and Uzbekistan. CSOs played key roles in local, community-based development and Subprogram 3 focused on supporting such initiatives through a three-pronged approach of (1) development of a CSO engagement plan and/or ADB-CSO Country Cooperation Plan, (2) updating country-specific civil society briefs, and (3) supporting project-specific engagement of CSOs to conduct community awareness-raising, capacity building, and other activities to support implementation of ADB operations. Subproject 3 supported the following activities: (1) CSO cooperation assessments for Armenia and Uzbekistan, (2) a country cooperation action plan for Armenia, (3) civil society briefs for Armenia (in English and Armenian translations) and Uzbekistan (in English, Uzbek, and Russian translations),²¹ (4) support to the CSO Tanadgoma in Georgia for an innovative learning demonstration alongside ADB's MFF Livable Cities Investment Program, (5) support for the Association of Business Women of Uzbekistan to conduct a gender awareness project alongside the Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation (CAREC) Corridor 2 Karakalpakstan Road Project, (6) support for the Child Development Foundation in Armenia to set up a hotline to provide services to those affected by conflict in the country alongside ADB's Human Development Enhancement Program, (7) support to KRASS in Uzbekistan to lead a farmers' awareness training program alongside ADB's Livestock Value Chain Development Project, and (8) CSO support provided to Center NIHOL in Uzbekistan to conduct community WASH training alongside ADB's Tashkent Province Sewerage Improvement Project. The TA also funded a regional civil society adviser (based first in Georgia and then in Uzbekistan) and a CSO resource person for road safety awareness campaigns in Uzbekistan.

The TA was able to fund a large number of outputs in proportion to the overall TA amount. Highlights of how these activities contributed to the Cluster TA's outputs include:

Output 1: Capacity for effective CSO engagement in the design, implementation, and monitoring of ADB projects was developed through workshops (e.g., Georgia, Mongolia, PNG, and Solomon Islands), tailored e-learning modules and Participation Tools for the Pacific, the high-level event hosted by Dr. Abhijit Banerjee on Social Protection for Economic Inclusion, and close collaboration with the resident missions to develop country cooperation action plans, among others. Training included discussions on ADB's business model, Safeguards policy, and Accountability Mechanism, among other information, and will form the basis for future capacity building activities across Asia and the Pacific. Each of these activities helped to raise awareness and capacity for engagement across ADB, DMCs, and CSOs, effectively setting the stage for civil society engagement across the project lifecycle.

Output 2: Numerous demonstration activities through effective civil society organization engagement were conducted throughout all three subprojects, including operational support to five DMCs under Subproject 1, the flagship demonstration of the Graduation Approach in Tamil Nadu under Subproject 2, and the support of five CSOs in Central and West Asia under Subproject 3.

¹⁴ The Graduation Approach is an innovation in social protection that builds on a foundation of social assistance with a holistic set of poverty reduction interventions aimed at tackling the multiple facets of poverty. The international CSO BRAC developed this model in Bangladesh in 2002 and it is an example of a CSO approach that ADB has integrated into its operations.

¹⁵ BRAC Ultra-Poor Graduation Initiative (BRAC UPGI). 2019. *DOLE Graduation Program: Building Resilience in the Philippines through Sustainable Livelihoods*. Manila.

¹⁶ ADB. 2021. *A Sourcebook for Engaging with Civil Society Organizations in Asian Development Bank Operations*. Manila.

¹⁷ ADB and BRAC UPGI. 2021. *Social Protection for Economic Inclusion: Adapting the Graduation Approach in Asia and the Pacific*. Manila.

¹⁸ Forthcoming publication in Q3 2022.

¹⁹ Forthcoming publication in Q3 2022.

²⁰ ADB. 2019. *Philippines: Malolos-Clark Railway Project*. Manila.

²¹ (i) ADB. 2021. *Civil Society Brief: Armenia*. Manila and (ii) ADB. 2021. *Civil Society Brief: Uzbekistan*. Manila.

Output 3: Knowledge products on effective CSO engagement at ADB were generated and shared under all three Subprojects, including: e-learning modules and Participation Tools for the Pacific under Subproject 1, the flagship CSO Sourcebook and country civil society briefs under Subproject 2, and additional civil society briefs under Subproject 3.

Overall, the activities conducted under the TA were highly relevant to ADB's goal under Strategy 2030 to strengthen collaboration with civil society organizations and served as strong demonstrations for civil society engagement across DMCs, ADB, and CSOs.

Technical Assistance Assessment Ratings

Criterion	Assessment	Rating
Relevance	<p>The TA was highly relevant to ADB's work given its strategic alignment with Strategy 2030 (Paragraph 108), which addresses the need to strengthen collaboration with CSOs across Asia and the Pacific. It also specifically responded to the needs of DMCs and the requests of operational departments. The use of a cluster TA allowed NGOC to conduct important foundational knowledge and capacity work in CSO engagement and sequence it with additional operational interventions to increase civil society engagement in relevant ADB projects as demand grew from regional departments. Operational interventions – such as piloting the Graduation approach in ADB-financed operations – were valuable in raising awareness of the approach across ADB, thus catalyzing further interventions within ADB operations. Knowledge products provided timely and highly relevant updates and were demand driven from the operational departments.</p> <p>There were no design deficiencies, and the results chain was sound and appropriate. The TA remained highly relevant and fully aligned to ADB's strategic goals and priorities throughout its implementation. A minor change in scope should have been processed to document updated operational department priorities to which the TA responded to which was supported by the design of the TA.</p>	Highly Relevant
Effectiveness	<p>The TA partially achieved its outcome. Performance indicators were achieved as follows: (3) Overachieved, (2) Exceeded, (3) Achieved, (1) Substantially Achieved, (1) Partially Achieved, (1) Not Achieved.</p> <p>Outcomes under Subprojects 2 and 3 exceeded their targets in addition to highly successful demonstration effects. Knowledge products also received acclaim from DMCs and operational departments and events and workshops were well attended.</p> <p>Outcomes under the Cluster TA and Subproject 1 were not achieved. Minor gaps in information availability hindered a full assessment.</p>	Effective
Efficiency	<p>The TA was extended twice due to the coronavirus disease (COVID-19) pandemic and prolonged project processing and design for the underlying project in Subproject 2; however, extensions remained under 2 years. Cost savings from activities were judiciously used to pursue outputs beyond the original scope, providing operational departments with additional resource persons, hosting workshops, and ensuring translation of materials as appropriate. No cost overruns occurred. TA</p>	Efficient

Criterion	Assessment	Rating
	activities generated a strong value for stakeholders as the TA achieved a large number of outputs and enhanced the development effectiveness of a number of projects. Strong demonstration effects also occurred under Subproject 2, where the Graduation Approach was piloted in the context of resettlement, and Subproject 3 where one of the CSOs was further funded by one of the operations departments.	
Overall Assessment	<p>Overall, the TA was Highly Relevant, Effective, and Efficient. The TA was Highly Relevant as it was strategically aligned with ADB's corporate priority of enhancing civil society engagement throughout design and implementation, the design and results chain was appropriate, and its rationale was sound. It was Effective as it delivered its intended impact even though Outcomes were not fully achieved. The TA was Efficient in that it did not experience cost overruns or implementation delays of over 2 years.</p> <p>The TA helped to deliver enhanced CSO engagement both at the institutional level and the operational level. Critically, it helped to pilot new approaches at ADB by integrating the Graduation approach into resettlement under Subproject 2 and conducting pilot demonstrations on CSO engagement in Subproject 3. Such approaches have catalyzed further work in these areas at ADB (e.g., the use of the Graduation Approach in the Malolos Clark Railway project). It also updated flagship NGOC knowledge products such as CSO Sourcebook, SARD report, and civil society briefs, which have been widely used by DMCs and operational departments.</p> <p>Minor areas for improvement – as discussed above – relate to the timely processing of minor changes in scope in response to operational department requests.</p>	Successful
Sustainability	The TA addressed the issue of enhanced civil society engagement through two broad approaches: (1) knowledge work and capacity building and (2) operational support. Knowledge work under the TA has already demonstrated sustainability through a high uptake. The effects of demonstration projects across all three subprojects have also served as an example for replication. ²² Due to the new ADB institutional indicator on CSO engagement, NGOC will be able to track high-level meaningful CSO engagement across the ADB portfolio.	Most Likely Sustainable

Lessons Learned and Recommendations

Design and/or planning	The demand-driven design feature enabled the TA to effectively meet the demands of regional departments. This approach should be continued in future NGOC TAs to remain highly relevant to operations. Operational departments also benefitted from resources specifically dedicated to civil society engagement on the ground (e.g., a dedicated staff consultant in Mongolia Resident Mission).
Implementation and/or delivery	The TA provided CSO support to ADB-financed projects, but some projects faced delays out of the project team's control. As such, not all CSO engagement support was timed as effectively as it could have been. CSOs by nature are dependent on external funding and do not have the

²² Under Subproject 2, resettlement in Tamil Nadu has not yet occurred; however, commitments from the Government in loan documents and funding sources ensure that the Graduation approach will be used in the project.

	flexibility to pause operations to await such changes to take place. Therefore, CSOs and project staff should discuss options and ensure that resources are used effectively in changed circumstances. A change in scope should have been processed to reflect operational department priorities so periodic reviews of DMFs would help ensure that documentation remains up to date.
Management of staff and consultants	Most of the CSOs engaged in this TA had limited understanding of ADB processes, impacting smooth delivery. The NGOC should ensure that CSOs receive clear information about how to deliver an ADB-financed contract and seek resident mission support to address language barriers if needed. Consultants who provide support to CSO engagement also need substantial briefings on ADB policies and procedures to be effective in their roles. A fixed staff consultant sitting in NGOC to provide support to CSOs engaged by operations could be considered.
Knowledge building	The knowledge products and training agendas developed under the TA are highly relevant to boosting CSO engagement in ADB-financed operations. The NGOC should continue to use the content in the future for training, awareness raising, onboarding new CSO anchors, and in developing additional tailored knowledge products for CSO engagement.
Stakeholder participation	Strong engagement of CSO anchors during processing ensured the TA remained relevant. CSOs contributed throughout the design of interventions, which ensured desired results.
Replication and/or scaling up	Replication and scale up began during TA implementation. The NGOC should continue to identify and support innovative CSO engagement approaches that are scalable and replicable. NGOC should also explore establishing a standing, demand-driven civil society fund to support CSO operational engagements. Communications, documentation, and organization of results – particularly under Subprogram 1 – could have been improved to maximize use of materials produced by the TA and effectively scale up outputs produced as a resource for DMCs and ADB staff in the future.

Follow-up Actions

- The NGOC should monitor progress of the Tamil Nadu resettlement when it begins in case the project teams require a refresher training-of-trainers course.
- The NGOC should continue to identify ways to share information from the TA-generated knowledge products, including by uploading them to external and internal sites and incorporating them into events and training.
- The NGOC should conduct a debrief with all CSOs engaged under the TA to better understand what the bottlenecks were in their administering an ADB-financed contract and to provide better support to future CSO engagements and to be inputs for relevant future knowledge products.
- NGOC should consider allocating resources for a long-term staff consultant position within NGOC to support operations with CSO interventions throughout the project lifecycle.
- Based on the high uptake of project teams for the funds to support CSO engagement, NGOC should explore establishment of a demand-driven fund to support CSO engagement in ADB-financed operations.

Prepared by:

Marina Best

Designation and Division:

Senior Social Development Specialist (Civil Society and Participation)
NGO and Civil Society Center, Sustainable Development and Climate Change Department

DESIGN AND MONITORING FRAMEWORK

Impact(s) Delivery of inclusive development services in selected DMCs improved (Sustainable Development Goal 10)		
Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Achievements
Outcome CSO participation in ADB operations strengthened	All new projects (2019 to 2021) in two DMCs include partnerships with CSOs where they are able to participate in decision making (2017 baseline: 0)	Partially Achieved. In Mongolia, ADB's Board of Directors approved 24 projects across 2019-2021, of which 19 (79%) included partnerships with CSOs. In Georgia (GEO) across 2019-2021, ADB's Board approved 9 projects, of which 5 (56%) included partnerships with CSOs.
Outputs 1. Capacity for effective CSO engagement in the design, implementation, and monitoring of ADB projects improved.	1a. Capacity building programs for CSO engagement in ADB operations are established and initiated in at least four DMCs, with participation of CSOs and government implementing agency staff, by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 0) 1b. At least 15 CSOs (at least two of which focus on women) plus five network CSOs in each selected DMC report improved understanding of ADB operations by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 0) 1c. Participants in workshops across three ADB regions report improved knowledge and understanding of enhanced CSO engagement implementation by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 1)	1a. Overachieved. Under Subproject 1 of the TA, capacity building programs took place for executing agencies, implementing agencies, and CSOs in Georgia, Mongolia (MON), and the Solomon Islands (SOL) with 305 men and women trained. A workshop was also held in the Pacific with participants from the Cook Islands (COO), Papua New Guinea (PNG), Republic of the Marshall Islands (RMI), Samoa (SAM), Tonga (TON), Vanuatu (VAN) and Timor-Leste. Under Subproject 3, a workshop for EAs, IAs, and CSOs was held in Uzbekistan (UZB). 1b. Overachieved. Based on technical progress reports for Subproject 1 of the TA, 84 CSOs, including 8 focused on women and 7 network CSOs, reported an improved understanding of ADB operations in Georgia. In Mongolia, 72 organizations, including 8 focused on women and 9 network CSOs, reported an improved understanding of ADB operations. 1c. Achieved. Workshops were held across the three target regions of CWRD, EARD, and PARD. Based on workshop reports, in Georgia, across three workshops, participants reported a 71%, 71%, and 84% increase in knowledge. In EARD, across two workshops, participants recorded a 30% and 21% increase in knowledge. In PARD, participants in a workshop reported a 9% increase in learning ^a
2. Demonstration activities through	2a. Four CSO country operations assessments and	2a. Substantially Achieved. Country Operations Assessments and ADB-CSO

Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Achievements
effective civil society organization engagement conducted	<p>ADB–CSO–country cooperation action plans developed, by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 1)</p> <p>2b. 10 project CSO participation plans completed, by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 5)</p> <p>2c. Eight new proposed ADB financed projects supported through higher-level CSO engagement (collaboration and partnerships) or CSO cofinancing, by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 5)</p> <p>2d. Country report on policies and programs for CSO engagement in national development plans prepared for four selected DMCs, by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 0)</p>	<p>Country Cooperation Action Plans were developed for Armenia, Georgia, and Mongolia. A Country Operations Assessment was also completed for Uzbekistan alongside a draft Action Plan that the Resident Mission agreed to internally finalize.</p> <p>2b. Partially Achieved. Five Participation plans were completed, including: (1) GEO: Preparing the North-South Corridor (Kvesheti-Kobi) Road Project; (2) MON: Ensuring Inclusiveness and Service Delivery for Persons with Disabilities, (3) MON: Improving Transport Services in Ger Areas, (4) MON: Support for Inclusive Education, and (5) SOL: Urban Water Supply and Sanitation Project.</p> <p>2c. Achieved (Target Exceeded). Higher-level CSO engagement was supported in: (1) ARM: Human Development Enhancement Program; (2) GEO: Livable Cities Investment Program; (3) GEO North-South Corridor (Kvesheti-Kobi) Road Project; (4) IND: Inclusive, Resilient and Sustainable Housing for the Urban Poor Project in Tamil Nadu; (5) KIR: South Tarawa Water Supply Project; (6) MON: Improving Transport Services in Ger Areas; (7) PNG: Rural Primary Health Services Delivery Project; (8) SOL: Urban Water Supply and Sanitation Project; (9) UZB: CAREC Corridor 2 Karakalpakstan Road Project; (10) UZB: Livestock Value Chain Development Project; and (11) UZB: Tashkent Province Sewerage Improvement Project.</p> <p>2d. Not Achieved. The 4 country teams set to prepare these country reports changed their minds about the need for these reports because of the external CSO-led initiatives that were providing this information in country. The TA team determined there was no longer a need to finance these reports.</p>
3. Knowledge products about effective CSO engagement in ADB operations generated and shared.	<p>3a. Online learning platforms and social media channels disseminate project e-learning and knowledge products from three regional departments, by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 1)</p> <p>3b. Three examples of improved business processes used to enhance CSO</p>	<p>3a. Achieved. Online learning channels disseminated information across CWRD, EARD, and PARD.^b Participation Tools for the Pacific were also disseminated online.^c</p> <p>3b. Achieved. Throughout the duration of the TA, NGOC published: (1) updated Operations Manual, (2) updated Staff Instructions, and (3)</p>

Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Achievements
	<p>engagement in ADB operations documented, by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 0)</p> <p>3c. Five country-, regional and/or sector-specific engagement guides for CSOs, ADB project development staff, and government agencies developed, by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 1)</p> <p>3d. Online learning courses completed by CSO and government officials, with sex disaggregated and demographic monitoring, in at least five DMCs by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 0)</p>	<p>the ADB institutional indicator and database on meaningful civil society engagement, which have all contributed to improved business processes. In addition, NGOC published the CSO Sourcebook, which contains a wide array of information on CSO engagement, particularly ADB business processes.^d</p> <p>3c. Achieved, (Target exceeded). Under the TA, NGOC authored country briefs for (1) Mongolia, (2) Georgia, (3) Timor Leste, (4) India, (5) Uzbekistan, and (6) Armenia. Three sector-specific engagement guides were developed for Mongolia in (6) WASH, (7) transport, and (8) inclusive education.</p> <p>3d. Overachieved. Online training courses were completed by CSOs and government officials in (1) GEO, (2) MON, (3) SOL, (4) VIE, and participants in the Pacific workshop, including the COO, PNG, RMI, TON, SAM, and VAN; including participants from Timor-Leste. Sex disaggregated data was collected for Pacific DMCs.</p>

Actual Key Activities with Milestones

1. Capacity for effective CSO engagement in the design, implementation, and monitoring of ADB projects improved

- 1.1 Assess capacity building needs through gap analysis and consultations with government, CSOs, and ADB staff (Q1 2018–Q3 2019). *Completed Q3 2018.*
- 1.2 Develop a curriculum and training program for CSOs and government officials (Q1 2018–Q2 2019). *Completed Q4 2018.*
- 1.3 Undertake capacity building training in selected DMCs (Q1 2018–Q2 2020). *Completed throughout the TA with the final activity in Q4 2021*
- 1.4 Draft capacity and institutional planning documents (Q1 2018–Q2 2019). *Completed Q4 2018*
- 1.5 Prepare country- and sector-specific engagement guides for CSOs, ADB project development staff, and government agencies (Q1 2019–Q2 2020). *Completed Q1 2022*
- 1.6 Monitor the effectiveness of capacity building outputs (Q1 2019–Q2 2020). *Completed Q1 2022*

2. Demonstration activities through effective CSO engagement conducted

- 2.1 Support resident mission on mainstreaming CSO engagement into selected projects and country partnership strategy and/or country operations business plan activities in selected DMCs (Q1 2018– Q2 2020). *Completed Q1 2022*
- 2.2 Support implementation of planned CSO participation in ongoing ADB-financed projects through TA and capacity building (Q1 2018–Q2 2020). *Completed Q1 2022*
- 2.3 Develop CSO cooperation action plans in country planning activities (Q1 2018–Q4 2020). *Partially Completed as of Q1 2022.*
- 2.4 Support integration of the knowledge and expertise of CSOs through the establishment of advisory committees at regional and national levels (Q1 2018–Q2 2020). *Completed at the national level Q1 2022.*

2.5 Support CSO engagement to improve inclusion of specific marginalized and vulnerable groups in ADB operations, particularly at the grassroots level (Q1 2018–Q2 2020). *Completed Q1 2022.*

2.6 Develop new CSO partnering and cofinancing demonstration activities (Q2 2018–Q2 2020). *Completed Q1 2022.*

2.7 Integrate context-sensitive CSO engagement into the design of new loans and grants in the ADB project pipeline (Q4 2018–Q2 2020). *Completed Q1 2022.*

3. Knowledge products about effective CSO engagement in ADB operations generated and shared

3.1 Capture and disseminate (locally and regionally) good CSO engagement practices, which improve inclusion of specific marginalized and vulnerable groups in ADB operations, particularly at the grassroots level (Q1 2018–Q2 2020). *Completed Q1 2022.*

3.2 Design CSO country knowledge plans and support their implementation (Q1 2018–Q2 2020). *Partially Completed Q3 2020.*

3.3 Knowledge on CSO engagement in ADB operations generated and shared using K-Learn and other suitable platforms (Q4 2018–Q2 2020). *Complete Q4 2018.*

3.4 Capture lessons from the demonstration of new business processes that enhance ADB–CSO engagement, evaluate their effectiveness, and disseminate lessons (Q4 2019–Q2 2020). *Incomplete.*

3.5 Capture and disseminate examples of CSO engagement in project planning, design, implementation, and monitoring; and highlight in-country and regional knowledge platforms that show how CSOs engagement enhances project quality and development results (Q4 2019–Q2 2020). *Completed Q1 2022.*

3.6 Design, test, and expand field-level knowledge activities involving peer learning (Q2 2018–Q2 2020). *Completed Q1 2022.*

TA Management Activities

Manage deployment of consultants and CSO partnerships, consultants' outputs, and partnerships; and prepare monitoring reports. *Completed Q1 2022.*

Actual Inputs

ADB: \$1,344,098.96

ADB = Asian Development Bank, COO = Cook Islands, CSO = civil society organization, CWRD = Central and West Asia Department, EARD = East Asia Department, DMC = developing member country, EA = executing agency, GEO = Georgia, IA = implementing agency, IND = India, KIR = Kiribati, MON = Mongolia, NGOC = NGO and Civil Society Center, PARD = Pacific Department, PNG = Papua New Guinea, Q = quarter, RMI = Republic of Marshall Islands, SAM = Samoa, SOL = Solomon Islands, TA = technical assistance, TIM = Timor-Leste, TON = Tonga, UZB = Uzbekistan, VAN = Vanuatu, VIE = Viet Nam.

^a Low learning increases for the workshop may be attributed to participants undertaking the baseline knowledge assessment after an initial training, thus impacting results.

^b ADB. eLearn. [Deepening Civil Society Engagement for Better Development Results for ADB Staff](#). Manila.

^c ADB. 2019. [Participation Tools for the Pacific - Part 1: Engaging Pacific Civil Society Organizations | Development Asia](#)

^d (i) ADB. [Operations Manual](#). Manila; (ii) ADB. [Development Effectiveness Review](#). Manila; and, (iii) ADB. 2021. [A Sourcebook for Engaging with Civil Society Organizations in Asian Development Bank Operations](#). Manila.

Source: ADB.

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COST

Table A2.1: Technical Assistance Cost by Activity
(\$'000)

Item	Amount		
	Original	Revised	Actual
1. Consultants	846.90	1,055.40	1,033.27
2. Equipment	171.00	8.40	7.36
3. Seminars, Workshops, Training	204.50	255.50	261.70
4. Studies, Surveys and Report	44.00	7.50	27.63
5. Miscellaneous Administration and Support Costs	78.60	28.20	14.13
6. Contingency	55.00	45.00	0.00
Total	1,400.00	1,400.00	1,344.09

Source: Asian Development Bank estimates.

Table A2.2: Technical Assistance Cost by Fund
(\$'000)

	TASF 6	TASF-other sources	Total Cost
1. Original	900.00	500.00	1,400.00
2. Revised	750.00	650.00	1,400.00
3. Actual	716.05	628.05	1,344.09
4. Unused	33.95	21.95	55.90

TASF = Technical Assistance Special Fund.

Source: Asian Development Bank estimates.

**TA 0026-REG: DEEPENING CIVIL SOCIETY ENGAGEMENT FOR DEVELOPMENT
EFFECTIVENESS
SUBPROJECTS MAJOR ACHIEVEMENTS**

TA Number	Major Subproject Achievements at TA Completion
9475-REG (Subproject 1)	<p>The Outcome for Subproject 1 (“<i>All new projects (2019 to 2021) in two DMCs include partnerships with CSOs where they are able to participate in decision-making</i>”) was Partially Achieved. In Mongolia, ADB’s Board of Directors approved 24 projects across 2019-2021, of which 19 (79%) included partnerships with CSOs. In Georgia across 2019-2021, ADB’s Board approved 9 projects, of which 5 (56%) included partnerships with CSOs.</p> <p>Performance indicators for Outputs were substantially exceeded, including: (4) Overachieved, (3) Achieved (Target Exceeded), (3) Achieved, and (1) Not Achieved.</p> <p>Major activities for Subproject 1 included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) Skills training was conducted for executing and implementing agencies in Georgia (December 2018), Mongolia (September 2018), the Solomon Islands (July 2018), and PNG (July 2018). (b) Training and capacity building workshops were held for CSOs in Georgia, Mongolia, and Pacific DMCs (held in Sydney). (c) E-learning modules were developed on CSO engagement and tailored to country specific needs. Modules were made accessible to the public through ADB elearn and translated into Mongolian language.²³ (d) Country Cooperation Assessments and Action Plans were created for Georgia and Mongolia. (e) Six modules on Participation Guide Tools for the Pacific were developed.²⁴ (f) Participation plans were drafted for Mongolia and the Solomon Islands. (g) Civil society Country Advisory Committees in Mongolia and Georgia were established. (h) Operational support was provided to (i) Georgia: North-South Corridor (Kvesheti-Kobi) Road Project; (ii) Mongolia: Improving Transport Services in Ger Areas; (iii) Papua New Guinea: Rural Primary Health Services Delivery Project; (iv) Solomon Islands: Urban Water Supply and Sanitation Project; (v) Kiribati: South Tarawa Water Supply Project. (i) A mapping of CSOs in Uzbekistan was conducted. (j) A dedicated staff consultant was financed on an intermittent basis at ADB’s Mongolia Resident Mission (MNRM).

²³ ADB. eLearn. [Deepening Civil Society Engagement for Better Development Results for ADB Staff](#). Manila.

²⁴ ADB. 2019. [Participation Tools for the Pacific - Part 1: Engaging Pacific Civil Society Organizations | Development Asia](#).

TA Number	Major Subproject Achievements at TA Completion
9592-REG (Subproject 2)	<p>The Outcome for Subproject 2 (“By 2020, <i>At least 5 new projects include partnerships with CSOs where they are able to participate in decision-making</i>”) was Overachieved. From 2018-2020, 205 projects across all DMCs approved by ADB’s Board included partnerships with CSOs.</p> <p>Performance indicators for Outputs were exceeded, including: (1) Overachieved, (1) Achieved (Target Exceeded), (3) Achieved, (1) Partially Achieved, and (1) Not Achieved.</p> <p>Major activities for Subproject 2 included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) The Graduation approach was piloted in the Philippines, providing support for 1,800 beneficiaries.²⁵ (b) The Graduation approach was designed and launched in Tamil Nadu for the Inclusive, Resilient and Sustainable Housing for the Urban Poor Project.²⁶ (c) The CSO Sourcebook was published.²⁷ (d) Workshops were held, including the high-level event on Social Protection for Economic Inclusion: Adapting the Graduation Approach in Asia and the Pacific which was opened by Nobel prize winning laureate Dr. Abhijit Banerjee. (e) A report analyzing CSO engagement in SARD was prepared.²⁸ (f) A civil society brief for India was authored.²⁹ (g) Support was provided for the civil society advisory group in Indonesia. (h) Funding was provided for a civil society expert in SARD to support due diligence for CSO engagement.
TA 9769-REG (Subproject 3)	<p>The Outcome for Subproject 3 (“<i>At least 5 new projects (2018 to 2020) include partnerships with CSOs where they are able to participate in decision-making</i>”) was Overachieved. From 2018-2020, 205 projects across all DMCs approved by ADB’s Board included partnerships with CSOs.</p> <p>Performance indicators for Outputs were exceeded, including: (2) Overachieved, (1) Achieved, (2) Partially Achieved, and (1) Not Achieved.</p> <p>Major activities for Subproject 3 included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) CSO cooperation assessments were authored for Armenia and Uzbekistan. (b) A country cooperation action plan was drafted for Armenia. (c) Civil society briefs were published for Armenia (in English and Armenian translations) and Uzbekistan (in English, Uzbek, and Russian translations).³⁰ (d) Support was provided to the CSO Tanadgoma in Georgia for an innovative learning demonstration alongside ADB’s MFF Livable Cities Investment Program. (e) Support was provided for the Association of Business Women of Uzbekistan to conduct a gender awareness project alongside the Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation (CAREC) Corridor 2 Karakalpakstan Road Project. (f) Support was provided for the Child Development Foundation in Armenia to set up a hotline to provide services to those affected by conflict in the country alongside ADB’s Human Development Enhancement Program.

²⁵ BRAC Ultra-Poor Graduation Initiative (BRAC UPGI). 2019. [DOLE Graduation Program: Building Resilience in the Philippines through Sustainable Livelihoods](#). Manila.

²⁶ ADB. 2021. [India: Inclusive, Resilient, and Sustainable Housing for Urban Poor Sector Project in Tamil Nadu](#). Manila.

²⁷ ADB. 2021. [A Sourcebook for Engaging with Civil Society Organizations in Asian Development Bank Operations](#). Manila.

²⁸ Forthcoming publication

²⁹ Forthcoming publication

³⁰ (i) ADB. 2021. [Civil Society Brief: Armenia](#). Manila and (ii) ADB. 2021. [Civil Society Brief: Uzbekistan](#). Manila.

TA Number	Major Subproject Achievements at TA Completion
	<p>(g) Support was provided to KRASS in Uzbekistan to lead a farmers' awareness training program alongside ADB's Livestock Value Chain Development Project.</p> <p>(h) Support was provided to Center NIHOL in Uzbekistan to conduct community WASH training alongside ADB's Tashkent Province Sewerage Improvement Project.</p> <p>(i) A regional civil society adviser (based first in Georgia and then in Uzbekistan) and a CSO resource person for road safety awareness campaigns in Uzbekistan were funded.</p>

DESIGN AND MONITORING FRAMEWORK: SUBPROJECT 1**Impact(s)**

Delivery of inclusive development services in selected DMCs improved (Sustainable Development Goal 10)

Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Achievements
Outcome CSO participation in ADB operations strengthened	All new projects (2019 to 2021) in two DMCs include partnerships with CSOs where they are able to participate in decision making (2017 baseline: 0)	Partially Achieved. In Mongolia, ADB's Board of Directors approved 24 projects across 2019-2021, of which 19 (79%) included partnerships with CSOs. In Georgia across 2019-2021, ADB's Board approved 9 projects, of which 5 (56%) included partnerships with CSOs.
Outputs 1. Capacity building products and services for CSOs and government agencies on effective CSO engagement in ADB projects Delivered	1a. Capacity building programs for CSO engagement in ADB operations are established and initiated in two DMCs, with participation of CSOs and government implementing agency staff, by December 2019 (2017 baseline: 0) 1b. At least 10 CSOs (at least two of which focus on women) plus two networks CSOs in two DMCs report improved understanding of ADB operations by December 2019 (2017 baseline: 0) 1c. Participants in workshops across three ADB regions report improved knowledge and understanding of enhanced CSO engagement implementation by December 2019 (2017 baseline: 1)	1a. Achieved (Target Exceeded). Under Subproject 1 of the TA, capacity building programs were initiated for executing agencies, implementing agencies, and CSOs in Mongolia, Georgia, and the Solomon Islands with 305 men and women trained. 1b. Overachieved. Under Subproject 1 of the TA, 84 CSOs, including 8 focused on women and 7 network CSOs, reported an improved understanding of ADB operations in Georgia. In Mongolia, 72 organizations, including 8 focused on women and 9 network CSOs, reported an improved understanding of ADB operations. ³¹ 1c. Achieved. Workshops were held across the three target regions of CWRD, EARD, and PARD. In Georgia, across three workshops, participants reported a 71%, 71%, and 84% increase in knowledge. In PARD, across two workshops, participants recorded a 30% and 21% increase in knowledge. In PARD,

Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Achievements
2. Good practice on the contribution of CSO participation to improving the quality of ADB operations disseminated	2a. Two CSO country operations assessments and ADB–CSO–country cooperation action plans developed, by December 2019 (2017 baseline: 1)	participants in a workshop reported a 9% increase in learning ³² 2a. Achieved (Target Exceeded). Country Operations Assessments and ADB-CSO Country Cooperation Action Plans were developed for Mongolia and Georgia. A Country Operations Assessment was also completed for Uzbekistan.
	2b. Online learning platforms and social media channels disseminate project e learning and knowledge products from three regional departments, by December 2019 (2017 baseline: 1)	2b. Overachieved. Online elearning modules were completed in December 2018 with modules adapted for country specific use in Georgia and Mongolia. An online learning program including six modules on Participation Tools for the Pacific was also developed for PARD.
	2c. Three country-, regional and/or sector-specific engagement guides for CSOs, ADB project development staff, and government agencies developed, by December 2019 (2017 baseline: 1)	2c. Overachieved. Under Subproject 1, NGOC published country briefs for (1) Mongolia, (2) Georgia, and (3) Timor Leste. Three sector-specific engagement guides were developed for Mongolia in (4) WASH, (5) Transport, and (6) Inclusive Education. An additional guidance note was published on (7) CSO Engagement in ADB.
3. Institutional linkages to facilitate increased CSO engagement Strengthened	3a. 5 project CSO-participation plans completed, by December 2019 (2017 baseline: 0)	3a. Achieved. Five project participation plans were completed by December 2019, including: (1) SOL: 51271 Urban Water Supply and Sanitation Project; (2) TA 9552-GEO: Preparing the North-South Corridor (Kvesheti-Kobi) Road Project; (3) MON: Improving Transport Services in Ger Areas; (4) MON: Support for Inclusive Education; and (5) MON: Ensuring Inclusiveness and Service Delivery for Persons with Disabilities.
	3b. Country report on policies and programs for CSO engagement in national development plans prepared for two DMCs by December 2019 (2017 baseline: 0)	3b. Not Achieved. The 2 country teams set to prepare these country reports changed their minds about the need for these reports because of the external CSO-led initiatives that were providing this information in country. The TA team determined there was no longer a need to finance these reports.

³² During the Solomon Islands workshop, many participants undertook the baseline knowledge assessment after initial training, thus impacting results.

Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Achievements
4. CSO knowledge and perspectives on ADB operations generated	<p>4a. Three new proposed ADB-financed projects supported through higher-level CSO engagement (collaboration and partnerships) or CSO cofinancing, by December 2019 (2017 baseline: 0)</p> <p>4b. One example of improved business processes used to enhance CSO engagement in ADB operations documented, by December 2019 (2017 baseline: 0)</p> <p>4c. Online learning courses completed by CSO and government officials, with sex-disaggregated and demographic monitoring, in at least two DMCs by December 2019 (2017 baseline: 0)</p>	<p>4a. Achieved (Target Exceeded). Under Subproject 1, higher-level CSO engagement was supported in: (1) GEO North-South Corridor (Kvesheti-Kobi) Road Project; (2) MON: Improving Transport Services in Ger Areas; (3) PNG: Rural Primary Health Services Delivery Project; (4) SOL: Urban Water Supply and Sanitation Project; and (5) KIR: South Tarawa Water Supply Project.</p> <p>4b. Overachieved. NGOC published: (1) Updated Operations Manual, (2) Updated Staff Instruction, and (3) the indicator and database on Meaningful Civil Society Engagement, which have all contributed to improved business processes.</p> <p>4c. Achieved. Online training courses were completed by CSOs and government officials in (1) Mongolia, (2) Georgia, and (3) the Solomon Islands. Demographic monitoring was completed for the Solomon Islands.</p>

KEY ACTIVITIES WITH MILESTONES

Output 1: Capacity building products and services for CSOs and government agencies on effective CSO engagement in ADB projects delivered

1.1 Assess capacity needs and training gaps of government agencies and CSOs in selected DMCs in CWRD, EARD, and PARD (Q3 2018)

1.2 Assess capacity building needs of relevant ADB staff to design for higher levels of CSO engagement in ADB projects (Q3 2018)

1.3 Prepare curricula, training programs, and interactive capacity building dialogue events (e.g. workshops, focus group discussions, roundtable discussions) on CSO engagement, aimed at and differentiated between CSOs and government agencies (Q4 2018)

1.4 Conduct training and other capacity building events for government agencies, CSOs in selected DMCs in CWRD, EARD, and PARD (Q4 2019) – Completed all by 2018.

Output 2: Good practice on the contribution of CSO participation to improving the quality of ADB operations disseminated

2.1 Conduct in-depth baseline assessment on CSO engagement in ADB operations and in-country development projects, in selected DMCs in CWRD, EARD, and PARD (Q3 2018)

2.2 Conduct ADB–CSO–country cooperation frameworks and action plans (Q4 2018)

2.3 Working closely with STGs, regional operations, and government agencies, develop guidelines for CSO engagement integrating the knowledge and expertise of CSOs into sector operations (Q1 2019)

2.4 Create knowledge products and services on CSO engagement good practices (Q4 2019)

Output 3: Institutional linkages to facilitate increased CSO engagement strengthened

3.1 Engage national consultants for selected regional departments, resident missions, or subregional offices (Q2 2018)

3.2 Identify complementary CSO activities, to be undertaken in parallel to ADB project activities (Q4 2019)

3.3 Organize small-scale CSO engagement activities to support project operations (Q4 2019)

Output 4: CSO knowledge and advice into ADB operations generated

4.1 Establish EAC and CAC, with TOR to review ADB's policies/procedures to facilitate higher levels of ADB–CSO–government engagement (Q3 2018)

4.2 Identify projects/TAs for higher levels of ADB–CSO engagement and design activities, draft CSO participation plans (Q4 2019)

Project Management Activities:

Manage deployment of consultants and CSO

Actual Inputs

Asian Development Bank: \$400,000

ADB = Asian Development Bank, CAC = Country Advisory Committee, CSO = civil society organization, CWRD = Central and West Asia Department, DMC = developing member country, EAC = External Advisory Committee, EARD = East Asia Department, NGOC = NGO and Civil Society Center, PARD = Pacific Department, RRP = report and recommendation of the President, SP1 = Subproject 1, STG = sector or thematic group, TA = technical assistance, TOR = terms of reference.

^a United Nations Development Programme. Sustainable Development Goal 10: Reduce Inequalities.

Source: Asian Development Bank.

DESIGN AND MONITORING FRAMEWORK: SUBPROJECT 2

Impact(s) Delivery of inclusive development services in selected DMCs improved (Sustainable Development Goal 10) ^a		
Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Achievements
Outcome CSO participation in ADB operations strengthened	At least 5 new projects (2018 to 2020) include partnerships with CSOs where they are able to participate in decisionmaking (2017 baseline: 0)	Overachieved. From 2018-2020, 205 projects across all DMCs approved by ADB's Board included partnerships with CSOs.
Outputs 1. Demonstration activities through effective civil society organization engagement conducted	1a. One treatment arm of the graduation approach in one of the poorest regions of the Philippines supported by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 0) 1b. Report on value of CSO engagement towards eliminating poverty through graduation approach delivered by March 2020 (2017 baseline: 0) 1c. 4 proposed or ongoing ADB-financed projects supported through higherlevel CSO engagement by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 0) 1d. 2 complementary outreach activities with CSOs supported by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 0)	1a. Achieved. From 2018 to 2020, the Department of Labor and Employment (DOLE) in the Philippines, in partnership with the Asian Development Bank and with the technical assistance of BRAC's Ultra-Poor Graduation Initiative (UPGI), launched a Graduation pilot targeting 1,800 beneficiaries of Pantawid Pamilyang Pilipino Program in 29 barangays across five municipalities in Negros Occidental. 1b. Achieved. BRAC submitted its final report in February 2022 ³³ 1c. Not Achieved. SARD requested the NGOC to consolidate all resources allocated for the 4 projects to provide larger-scale support to one project, which was the Inclusive, Resilient and Sustainable Housing for the Urban Poor Project in Tamil Nadu. A minor change in scope should have been processed to reflect changing operational department priorities. 1d. Achieved (Target Exceeded) Under Subproject 2, a workshop was held in Viet Nam to train CSOs on monitoring of ADB safeguards, a Graduation learning event was hosted, and Indonesia's civil society advisory support was supported.
2. Knowledge products (KPs) about effective CSO engagement in ADB operations generated and shared	2a. 1 specific CSO engagement guidance note for ADB project development staff, and government agencies published by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 0)	2a. Achieved. ADB launched the CSO Sourcebook in December 2021.

Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Achievements
	2b. 4 KPs on innovative approaches in civil society engagement in ADB financed projects completed by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 0)	2b. Overachieved. Under Subproject 2, several knowledge products were funded: (1) the SARD report on CSO engagement, which is currently in the process of being published, (2) the India Civil Society brief, (3) the CSO Sourcebook, (4) 3 videos on the Graduation approach, and (5) a draft blog on the Graduation approach.
	2c. 2 CSO briefs in the ADB series published by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 0)	2c. Partially Achieved. The India Civil Society brief is a forthcoming publication. Plans to update the Civil Society Brief: Myanmar were cancelled due to the events of February 1, 2021.

Actual Key Activities with Milestones

1. Demonstration activities through effective civil society organization engagement conducted

- 1.1 Organize consultation meeting with ADB, BRAC Philippines, and government stakeholders to finalize work plan for the third treatment arm of beneficiaries in its ongoing work in the graduation program (Q3 2018).
- 1.2 Conduct regular review meetings to monitor the implementation progress of the third treatment arm in the graduation program (Q4 2019).
- 1.3 Prepare a report to showcase the value of CSO engagement towards eliminating poverty (Q1 2020).
- 1.4 Identify, in close collaboration with project officers, ADB-financed projects/programs where civil society engagement will deliver improved development results (Q1 2019).
- 1.5 Determine areas of support that will deliver most effective CSO engagement and project results (Q2 2019).
- 1.6 Support projects in line with agreed approach (Q2 2020)

2. Knowledge products about effective CSO engagement in ADB operations generated and shared

- 2.1 Finalize guidance note for DMCs and ADB staff on how to engage CSOs (Q4 2018).
- 2.2 Identify innovative approaches in CSO engagement and document these in KPs (Q3 2020).
- 2.3 Develop four KPs on innovative approaches in civil society engagement in ADB-financed projects (Q4 2019).

Actual Inputs

Asian Development Bank: \$500,000

ADB = Asian Development Bank, BTOR = back-to-office report, CSO = civil society organization, DMC = developing member country, KP = knowledge product, NGOC = NGO and Civil Society Center.

^a United Nations Development Programme. Sustainable Development Goal 10: Reduce Inequalities.

^b Defined as collaboration and partnerships.

Source: Asian Development Bank.

DESIGN AND MONITORING FRAMEWORK: SUBPROJECT 3

Impact(s) Delivery of inclusive development services in selected DMCs improved (Sustainable Development Goal 10)		
Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Achievements ^a
Outcome CSO participation in ADB operations strengthened	By 2020, at least 5 new projects include partnerships with CSOs where they are able to participate in decision-making (2017 baseline: 0)	Overachieved. From 2018-2020, 205 projects across all DMCs approved by ADB's Board included partnerships with CSOs.
Outputs 1. Capacity for effective CSO engagement in the design, implementation, and monitoring of ADB projects improved. 2. Demonstration activities through effective CSO engagement conducted 3. Knowledge products about effective CSO engagement in ADB operations generated and shared	1a. At least eight participants to CSO workshop report improved capacity, by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 0) 2a. Seven proposed ADB-financed projects supported through higher-level CSO engagement by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 5) 2b. Two CSO country operations assessments and ADB-CSO-country cooperation action plans developed, by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 1) 2c. Country report on policies and programs for CSO engagement in national development plans completed for two selected DMCs, by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 0) 3a. Two country-specific engagement guides (CSO Briefs) developed, by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 1) 3b. 20 participants in a graduation approach learning event report improved	1a. Overachieved. 20 DMC officials attended the training with most participants reporting that they obtained new knowledge and skills and will be able to apply lessons in their work. 2a. Partially Achieved. Across Central West Asia, the TA supported (1) GEO: Livable Cities Investment Program; (2) UZB: CAREC Corridor 2 Karakalpakstan Road Project; (3) ARM: Human Development Enhancement Program; (4) UZB: Livestock Value Chain Development Project; (5) UZB: Tashkent Province Sewerage Improvement Project. In addition, the project supported (6) a Resource Person for projects in Uzbekistan. 2b. Partially Achieved. Country Cooperation assessments were developed for Armenia and Georgia. A country cooperation action plan was completed for Armenia. 2c. Not Achieved. Local CSO initiatives in reporting on CSO engagement in national development plans rendered this assignment unnecessary and was dropped. 3a. Achieved. CSO Briefs for Armenia and Uzbekistan were published and posted on the web in October 2021 and November 2021, respectively. 3b. Overachieved. A graduation approach learning event was held and well attended with 707 registrants and 299 attendees from 41 countries. Follow up

Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Achievements ^a
	knowledge of the graduation approach, by December 2020 (2017 baseline: 0)	activities document the improved knowledge of substantially more than 20 participants from the event, including ADB staff (new members of the Graduation Working Group) and DMC officials who supported incorporation of the approach into their ADB-financed projects.
Actual Key Activities with Milestones 1 Capacity for effective CSO engagement in the design, implementation, and monitoring of ADB projects improved 1.1 Identify CSO representatives and implementing agency officials to participate in training on ADB CSO-government cooperation in ADB-financed projects (August 2019). 1.2 Support participation costs of participants at the workshop (September 2019) 2 Demonstration activities through effective civil society organization engagement conducted 2.1 Conduct workshops on hygiene awareness, gender activities, and farmer awareness in Uzbekistan and kindergarten education in Georgia (July 2019). 2.2 Finalize scope of work of CSOs in Armenia (September 2019) 2.3 Monitor progress of CSO demonstration projects (Ongoing until December 2020) 2.4 Conduct research and develop CSO country operations assessments and ADB-CSO-country cooperation action plans for Armenia and Uzbekistan (December 2020). 2.5 Conduct research and develop country reports on policies and programs for CSO engagement in national development plans for Armenia and Uzbekistan (December 2020). 3 Knowledge products about effective CSO engagement in ADB operations generated and shared 3.1 Collaborate with BRAC to design learning event about the graduation approach (January 2020). Actual Inputs Asian Development Bank: \$500,000		

ADB = Asian Development Bank, ARRM = Armenia Resident Mission; BTOR = back-to-office report, CSO = civil society organization, DMC = developing member country, KP = knowledge product, NGOC = NGO and Civil Society Center; TA = technical assistance, URM = Uzbekistan Resident Mission.

a United Nations Development Programme. Sustainable Development Goal 10: Reduce Inequalities.

Source: Asian Development Bank.