



Completion Report

Project Number: 53327-001
Technical Assistance Number: 9773
July 2021

Kazakhstan: Mobilizing Finance to Help Achieving Sustainable Development Goals

This document is being disclosed to the public in accordance with ADB's Access to Information Policy.

Asian Development Bank

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

TA Number, Country, and Name: TA 9773-KAZ: Mobilizing Finance to Help Achieving Sustainable Development Goals		Amount Approved: \$225,000	
		Revised Amount: Not applicable	
Executing Agency: Ministry of National Economy of the Republic of Kazakhstan	Source of Funding: Technical Assistance Special Fund-Others	Amount Undisbursed: \$0	Amount Used: \$225,000
TA Approval Date: 29 July 2019	TA Signing Date: 29 July 2019	TA Completion Date	
		Original Date: 30 June 2020	Latest Revised Date: 31 December 2020
		Financial Closing Date: 31 March 2021	Number of Extensions: 1
TA Type: Knowledge and support TA	Nature of Activity: Capacity development Policy advice	TA Arrangement: Small-scale	

Description

In May 2019 during the country programming mission, the Ministry of National Economy (MNE) requested ADB's support to assist with the creation of a development partners' coordination platform aimed at filling knowledge and investment gaps to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) by 2030. Such a platform was meant as a tool helping individual development partners to facilitate their resources allocation, avoid overlaps, while capturing synergies across different projects and programs. As such, the creation of the platform could help identify priority areas for interventions by individual development partners, under MNE's coordination. Given the close partnership between ADB and United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) country offices in supporting the SDGs agenda, ADB would work closely with UNDP in creating the needed platform. ADB's 2017–2021 country partnership strategy for Kazakhstan calls for an active involvement of ADB in establishing a "Partnership for Development" platform to identify investment and knowledge gaps with the government and other local stakeholders participation, including the larger community of multilateral and bilateral agencies.¹

Expected Impact, Outcome, and Outputs

The expected impact of the technical assistance (TA) was to improve quality of life of the people in line with the SDG targets and Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development standards. The expected outcome was to improve coordination between agencies on SDG programs. The TA had two interlinked outputs: (i) MNE and related agencies' capacity in measuring SDGs' knowledge and investment gaps is strengthened; and (ii) platform for coordinating development partners' support to achieve SDGs is established. Both outputs would have supported the SDGs nationalization process by identifying knowledge and investment gaps, building capacity of stakeholders and establishing multilateral dialogue platform.

Implementation Arrangements

MNE served both as the executing and implementing agency for the TA. The Kazakhstan Resident Mission administered the TA. The proceeds of the TA were disbursed following ADB's *Technical Assistance Disbursement Handbook* (2010, as amended from time to time). ADB jointly with the UNDP country office in Kazakhstan closely coordinated all TA's activities while UNDP provided parallel financing to conduct the Development Finance Assessment (DFA) study and the First Regional SDGs Summit on Mobilizing Finance in Almaty.² The TA mobilized an international consultant for a total of 5.57 person-months to deliver the TA's first output on building capacity and measuring SDGs' knowledge and investment gaps. Three service providers were hired to assist with organizing the Regional SDGs Summit for 4 person-months each to: (i) develop design of the event venue; (ii) draft event program and manage list of participants; and (iii) coordinate travel and arrange accommodation of the event participants. The TA covered expenses of speakers and resource persons attending the Regional SDGs Summit. UNDP provided venue for the Regional SDGs Summit in Almaty; covered travel, accommodation and per diem expenses of some of the summit speakers; and simultaneous translation services during the summit. UNDP's overall contribution was estimated at around \$50,000.

¹ ADB. 2017. [Kazakhstan Country Partnership Strategy 2017–2021](#). Manila.

² KazInform. 2019. [Almaty hosts first regional SDG Summit](#). Online news agency.

The ADB hired international consultant undertook Rapid Integrated Assessment (RIA) of national budget analysis and conducted DFA study in collaboration with UNDP-hired local think-tank Talap. The UNDP parallel funding amounted to \$30,000 to finance Talap, which collected relevant data, performed analysis and assisted with organizing local stakeholders' meetings and dissemination of the research findings.

The TA completion date was extended for 6-month period until December 2020 to continue, finalize and publish the DFA due to delays in light of coronavirus disease (COVID-19) situation. The DFA report was published in February 2021³. An online Brown Bag Seminar on the DFA's findings and lessons learned was organized in April 2021.⁴

Conduct of Activities

Output 1: MNE and related agencies' capacity in measuring SDGs' knowledge and investment gaps strengthened. The output was substantially achieved in close collaboration with development partners. UNDP supported the preparation of a comprehensive methodology to assess SDGs' knowledge and investment gaps with RIA and DFA as building blocks for creating an Integrated National Financing Framework (INFF) in the country. UNDP proposed ADB to conduct RIA of national budget analysis by attributing state budget to specific SDGs, and DFA by analyzing funds flow and sources for financing of SDGs. ADB, in close coordination with UNDP, updated terms of references for an international consultant to assist with measuring SDGs' knowledge and investment gaps and training local stakeholders. Besides methodological support UNDP hired local consultants to assist with RIA and DFA studies. In October 2019, the international consultant presented RIA and DFA methodology, and conducted trainings for key local experts and stakeholders. Around 20 participants attended these trainings with 93% reporting their improved awareness on SDGs' knowledge and investment gaps. On 15 November 2019, the preliminary DFA and RIA results were presented at the Regional SDG Summit. On 16 January 2020, the DFA findings and recommendations were presented at the high-level meeting of the SDG Coordination Council.⁵ Subsequently the DFA report was revised and updated in line with the government's feedback and stakeholders' suggestions and published by ADB in February 2021. RIA of Kazakhstan's development plans and programs indicated that they were well aligned with SDGs and cover up to 79.9% of the targets. The report was submitted to the Ministry of Finance of Kazakhstan as the first step towards adopting INFF. On 30 September and 1 October 2020, the international consultant conducted a two-day training for the Economic Research Institute, a government designated SDGs secretariat, on financing strategies to increase the efficiency and effectiveness of public spending towards SDGs with specific reference to RIA and DFA studies. The combined in-country ADB and UNDP collaboration on SDGs led to a successful mobilization of a \$1 million grant from the UN Joint SDG Fund to operationalize the RIA and DFA recommendations in Kazakhstan through a UN Joint Programme launched in November 2020.

Output 2. Platform for coordinating development partners' support to achieve SDGs established. The output was substantially achieved by organizing a regional summit and brainstorming session with development partners. In close consultations with the government ADB organized a first regional SDGs Summit on Mobilizing Finance on 15–16 November 2019. Summit proceedings report with recommendations on strengthening development partners coordination and SDGs implementation was submitted to the government and widely shared with the participants. The second (subsequent) Regional SDGs Summit was planned for November 2020, but COVID-19 travel and quarantine restrictions prevented the summit from being organized. On 7 February 2020, government officials, representatives of international financial institutions, other development partners held a brainstorming session on the establishment of the Development Partners Coordination Council in Kazakhstan. Participants discussed and presented their views on ways to improve the coordination among development partners and government. Development partners recommended the MNE to regularly conduct consultations by formally establishing the council through corresponding resolution. The MNE agreed but has yet to implement this recommendation with limited staff resources. Organization of the high-level summit and brainstorming session necessitated the TA funds reallocation to cover the relevant expenditures.

Technical Assistance Assessment Ratings

Criterion	Assessment	Rating
Relevance	The TA is closely aligned with the government's objective of translating the Agenda 2030 commitment into action. In 2018, the government formed five working groups in accordance with the SDGs "P" principles (Peace, People, Planet, Prosperity and Partnership). On 16 July 2019, Kazakhstan presented its first Voluntary National Review at the High-Level Political Forum in New York. Also, on numerous occasions the government stated the idea of	Relevant

³ ADB. 2021. [Kazakhstan Development Finance Assessment](#). Manila.

⁴ ADB. 2021. [CWRD BrownBag Seminar: Development Finance Assessment of Kazakhstan: Key Findings and Lessons Learned](#). Online video.

⁵ The SDG Coordination Council chaired by the Deputy Prime Minister of Kazakhstan was established on behalf of the Prime Minister of Kazakhstan on 15 August 2018. The coordination body of the Council is the Ministry of National Economy. The Secretariat is the Economic Research Institute, which provides expert and analytical support.

Criterion	Assessment	Rating
	<p>establishing a regional SDGs Center (Hub) in Almaty with the President of Kazakhstan reiterating the proposal at the 75th session of the UN General Assembly. The government and development partners' suggestions were incorporated during the TA designing stage.</p> <p>The TA supported the Kazakhstan Country Partnership Strategy (CPS), 2017–2021 objectives implementation by establishing an SDGs' centered dialogue platform for government, stakeholders and development partners along with organizing a "periodic Kazakhstan Development Forum" (para. 21 of CPS). CPS indicates such platform would assist ADB to identify SDGs investment and knowledge gaps for financing through its lending operations and technical assistance, while preventing overlaps and capturing synergies with development partners. The TA design was appropriate in terms of components configuration and technical soundness to achieve the envisaged development goals. Also, the TA explains "knowledge and financial interventions" to nationalize SDG targets as envisioned by CPS (para. 19).</p>	
Effectiveness	<p>The TA contributed towards improvement of coordination between agencies on SDG programs (outcome) by organizing regional SDGs summit, conducting research and trainings. The summit participants deliberated on opportunities and challenges for achieving the SDGs through collective actions and regional cooperation on the themes of water, energy and climate resilience.</p> <p>The TA outputs were achieved with report on development partners coordination submitted to the government and widely disseminated among summit participants. The SDGs' knowledge and investment gaps were measured by utilizing existing UNDP methodologies on RIA and DFA. The DFA report was published online by ADB, while RIA of national budget analysis was submitted to the government. Both the DFA and RIA supported the development of comprehensive methodology for measuring SDGs' knowledge and investment gaps led by UNDP.</p>	Effective
Efficiency	<p>The TA achieved full utilization of the funds with 6-months extension needed to update, revise and publish the DFA report. The COVID-19 pandemic slowed down the pace of communication, feedback, review and comments integration. Also, the report required some revisions to incorporate the latest developments.</p>	Efficient
Overall Assessment	<p>The TA was <i>relevant</i> to the government's and ADB's objectives, implemented in <i>effective</i> and <i>efficient</i> manner. The task of measuring SDGs knowledge and investment gaps was operationalized by conducting RIA and DFA. The dialogue platform was established through organizing a regional SDGs Summit, which allowed all stakeholders to network and communicate about mobilizing funds for SDGs.</p>	Successful
Sustainability	<p>On 27 November 2020, UNDP launched a Development of the Integrated National Financial Framework towards achieving SDGs project with a \$1 million grant from the UN Joint SDG Fund. The government actively works towards SDGs integration in the state program documents and strategies, as well as advocates for establishing regional SDGs Hub in Almaty. The COVID-19 pandemic however prevented the second regional SDGs summit from being organized in November 2020. Meanwhile the government held a virtual annual high-level meeting of the SDG Coordination Council chaired by the First Deputy Prime Minister on 12 March 2021. The MNE is yet to assign its staff to convene regular Development partners' meetings while facing resource constraints.</p>	Likely sustainable

Lessons Learned and Recommendations

Design and/or planning	The TA report and terms of references for consultants were developed in close consultation with the UNDP colleagues by incorporating their expertise and knowledge. Close collaboration with UNDP is necessary taking into consideration its mandate and expertise in supporting the states with SDGs nationalization and implementation
Implementation and/or delivery	UNDP provided parallel financing for the TA activities; co-organized the regional summit by paying some of the costs and hired a local think-tank "Talap" who supported ADB-hired international consultant. Synergies and complementarities can be achieved through strong collaboration with development partners.

Knowledge building	ADB and UNDP contributed to DFA report production, but its joint publication required signing a corresponding Administrative Arrangement or intellectual property agreement involving legal departments, which was time and resource consuming. ⁶ ADB and UNDP agreed that ADB would publish the DFA report while acknowledging UNDP's contribution.
Stakeholder participation	ADB-hosted regular stakeholder meetings allowed to promptly discuss issues, make decisions, and successfully organize the regional SDGs summit.
Partnership	ADB closely collaborated with UNDP in implementing the TA activities while avoiding excessive paperwork and remaining flexible. The TA implementation experience suggests that ADB and UNDP can effectively collaborate by implementing parallel activities.
Replication and/or scaling up	The COVID-19 pandemic and lack of TA resources for upper middle income countries prevented the scaling up of the planned activities.
Post-TA financial resource	UNDP will continue to support the government with nationalization and implementation of SDGs with ADB support provided at the government's request.
Other lessons	None

Follow-up Actions

ADB support to the establishment of a platform for coordinating development partners' assistance can be provided in case government allocates necessary resources to ensure its sustainability.

Prepared by: Genadiy Rau

Designation and Division: Economics Officer, KARM, CWRD

⁶ ADB. 2019. [*Memorandum of Understanding between the United Nations Development Programme and the Asian Development Bank*](#). Manila.

DESIGN AND MONITORING FRAMEWORK

Impact Improvement in the quality of life of the population in line with the SDGs and OECD standards (Kazakhstan 2025 Strategic Development Plan, 2018) ^a		
Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Achievements
Outcome Coordination between agencies on SDG programs improved	a. By 2021, at least 70% of training participants reporting improved capacity to measure gaps in their field of expertise/work (2019 baseline: 0) b. By 2021, at least 80% of training participants reporting improved coordination between agencies on SDG programs (2019 baseline: 0)	a. Achieved. ADB and UNDP organized a range of trainings for civil servants, think tanks and Economic Research Institute on SDGs measurement. Training surveys indicate that 87% of participants improved their knowledge and skills in measuring SDGs related knowledge and investment gaps. b. Partially achieved. The first Regional SDGs Summit and brainstorming session on establishment of the Development Partners Coordination Council assisted in improving the coordination between agencies on SDG programs. However, the government did not formally establish the Development Partners Coordination Council. 67% of SDG's knowledge and investment gaps training survey respondents indicated excellent or very good coordination between agencies on SDGs agenda.
Outputs 1. MNE and related agencies' capacity in measuring SDGs' knowledge and investment gaps strengthened 2. Platform for coordinating development partners' support to achieve SDGs established	1a. By 2020, a report containing methodologies for measuring SDGs' knowledge and investment gaps completed (2019 baseline: none) 1b. By 2021, at least 80% of training participants reporting improved awareness on SDG's knowledge and investment gaps (2019 baseline: 0) 2a. By 2021, a report with recommendations on strengthening development partners coordination completed (2018 baseline: none)	1a. Partially achieved. Considering absence of the countrywide target indicators for each of the SDG and comprehensive methodology for measuring knowledge and investment gaps, ADB and UNDP partnered to inform the decision makers on funding flows available for SDGs (DFA) and earmarked state budget to SDGs (RIA). 1b. Achieved. The RIA and DFA trainings were attended by around 20 participants from the governments and think-tanks with 93% reporting improved awareness on SDG's knowledge and investment gaps. 2a. Substantially achieved. Report with recommendations on strengthening development partners coordination and SDGs implementation was developed as the first Regional SDGs Summit proceedings. The report was submitted to the government and widely shared with the summit participants. Limited government staff resources preclude organizing regular development partners' coordination meetings.

Actual Key Activities with Milestones**1. MNE and related agencies' capacity in measuring SDGs' knowledge and investment gaps strengthened**

- 1.1 Developed TOR for international consultant to conduct RIA and DFA studies in close collaboration with UNDP (August–September 2019)
- 1.2 Identified international consultant for RIA and DFA studies (October 2019)
- 1.3 Conducted RIA and DFA studies with capacity building of local stakeholders (October 2019–February 2020)
- 1.4 Presented RIA and DFA studies to the government at the SDG Coordination Council chaired by the First Deputy Prime Minister (January 2020)
- 1.5 Incorporated feedback of the government/stakeholders and revised the RIA and DFA studies (February–June 2020)
- 1.6 Updated and finalized the DFA study and conducted capacity building of ERI staff (July–December 2020)
- 1.7 Published the DFA study online on ADB website (February 2021)

2. Platform for coordinating development partners' support to achieve SDGs established

- 2.1 Developed TORs for service providers to assist with organizing the Regional SDGs Summit (August–September 2019)
- 2.2 Hired service providers to assist with organizing the Regional SDGs Summit (September 2019)
- 2.3 Developed agenda of the Regional SDGs Summit in coordination with MNE and UNDP (August–October 2019)
- 2.4 Organized the Regional SDGs Summit in close coordination with MNE and UNDP (November 2019)
- 2.5 Developed summit proceedings report with recommendations on strengthening development partners coordination and SDGs implementation (November 2019–January 2020)
- 2.6 Organized brainstorming session on establishment of the Development Partners Coordination Council (February 2020)

Actual Inputs

Asian Development Bank (TASF-other sources): \$225,000

ADB = Asian Development Bank, DFA = development finance assessment; ERI = Economic Research Institute; MNE = Ministry of National Economy; RIA = rapid integrated assessment; SDG = Sustainable Development Goal; TA = technical assistance; TOR = terms of reference; UNDP = United Nations Development Programme.

^a <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/U1800000636>

Source: Asian Development Bank.

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COST

Table A2.1: Technical Assistance Cost by Activity
(\$'000)

Item	Amount ^a		
	Original ^b	Revised	Actual
1. Consultants	120.000	95.181	89.171
2. Training, seminars and/or conferences	75.000	126.819	134.060
3. Miscellaneous TA administration	20.000	2.000	1.769
4. Contingency	10.000	1.000	0.000
Total	225.000	225.000	225.000

^a Financed by ADB's Technical Assistance Special Fund.

^b Original estimated cost in the TA report.

Source: Asian Development Bank estimates.

Table A2.2: Technical Assistance Cost by Fund
(\$'000)

	TASF-other sources	Total Cost
1. Original ^a	225.000	225.000
2. Revised	225.000	225.000
3. Actual	225.000	225.000
4. Unused	0.000	0.000

TASF = Technical Assistance Special Fund.

^a Original estimated cost in the TA report.

Source: Asian Development Bank estimates.