

# TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

Division: Governance and Regional Cooperation

<b>TA No. and Name:</b> TA 6089-REG: STRENGTHENING RESULTS-BASED MANAGEMENT <sup>a</sup> FOR SECTOR AGENCIES	<b>Amount Approved:</b> \$250,000
<b>Executing Agency:</b> Asian Development Bank in close cooperation with the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport, Cambodia and the Ministry of Science, Technology, Education and Culture, Mongolia	<b>Source of Funding:</b> TASF <b>Amount Undisbursed:</b> \$16,189.96 <b>Amount Utilized:</b> \$233,810.04
<b>TA Approval:</b> 19 December 2002 <b>Fielding of Consultants:</b> 1–5 September 2003, ADB Headquarters 7–20 September 2003, Mongolia 26 October–8 November 2003, Cambodia 17–18 November 2003, Mongolia 24–30 November 2003, Cambodia	<b>TA Completion Date</b> <b>Original:</b> April 2004 <b>Actual:</b> 15 March 2005 <b>Account Closing Date:</b> <b>Original:</b> December 2003 <b>Actual:</b> 11 March 2005
<p><b>Description</b></p> <p>Consistent with the Asian Development Bank's (ADB's) increasing emphasis on Managing for Development Results (MfDR) and the ADB's Governance Policy, the regional technical assistance (RETA) was designed to identify measures to improve sector agencies' understanding and results-orientation of sector management processes. The education sectors in Mongolia and Cambodia were selected as pilot sectors.</p> <p><b>Objectives and Scope</b></p> <p>The TA was designed to (i) give high-level policy makers, planners, and managers in the two developing member countries (DMCs) sound practical guidance on results-based management (RBM) in education, incorporating strategic linkage with broader governance, public financial management, and decentralization reforms; (ii) familiarize central and provincial education officials in the use of RBM institutional assessment techniques; (iii) identify potential good practice and apply RBM principles to case studies; (iv) facilitate DMC officials in RBM road map preparation and RBM capacity development (CD); and (v) facilitate knowledge exchange between the two DMCs.</p> <p>The RETA was envisaged to adopt an iterative process to enable sector agencies to apply institutional assessment instruments to their own circumstances to gain an understanding of RBM processes. The RETA design emphasized close involvement of cross-cutting agencies, such as Ministry of Finance and Interior/Home Affairs and cross-country learning. The overall RETA design was satisfactory. However, following the adoption of ADB's MfDR Action Plan, the terms of reference needed to be revised to allow for more emphasis on dissemination activities, such as showcasing the country RBM experiences within ADB and the wider development community. This also required an extension of the completion date of the RETA. The extension also facilitated an opportunity for RBM findings to feed into ongoing ADB lending operations in education in Mongolia and Cambodia, including influence on RBM-oriented CD activities and sector performance management strategy. For example, the RETA helped guide the Cambodia Education Sector Development Program 2 program loan policy matrix and advisory technical assistance for education governance and regulatory reforms.</p> <p><b>Evaluation of Inputs</b></p> <p>The original inputs included: (i) 6 person-months of international consulting services and 18 person-months of domestic consulting services; (ii) two consultant visits to each DMC for field assessment and one to ADB for initial RETA planning and coordination with parallel TA 6096-REG: Supporting the Sector Approach and RBM in ADB Operations; (iii) operational support for two RBM workshops/seminars in each DMC; and (iv) operational support for knowledge management and dissemination. A subsequent contract variation provided for an additional 1 person-month of international consultancy input and 4 person-months of domestic consultancy input. Recognizing the importance of adopting an iterative and flexible approach to RETA planning and implementation, consultants were selected on the basis of proven ability to enable confidence building and ownership of evolving RBM approaches and instruments within the two DMCs.</p>	

<sup>a</sup> While the term results-based management (RBM) was common in ADB when the RETA was designed, the ADB's Results Agenda, which was introduced in 2003, introduced the term Management for Development Results (MfDR). To be consistent with the initial design of the RETA, the term RBM will be used throughout the TCR.

The performance of the Cambodian and Mongolian EAs was satisfactory. The domestic consultant input in Mongolia proved highly successful, especially enabling high-level contact and ownership and was rated successful. The Cambodian domestic consultant proved far less reliable and the potential risks to the RETA were mitigated by proactive efforts by education ministry information staff, Cambodia Resident Mission, and the lead consultant. The Cambodian domestic consultant was rated unsatisfactory. The two international consultants were rated exceptional.

### **TA Outputs/Outcomes Evaluation**

1. *In-country seminars* have ensured substantial ownership and understanding of RBM-oriented approaches to education sector planning and management through (i) effective use of RBM institutional assessment instruments for initial baseline assessment; (ii) understanding of the relationship between RBM at the sector level and broader governance, public finance, and decentralization reforms; (iii) establishment of RBM education taskforces in both DMCs for case study analysis and follow-up work; and (iv) continuation of RBM working groups in both countries, incorporating strategic discussions between central, provincial, district, and school-level officials.
2. *RBM case studies* have proved an effective vehicle for DMC education staff to apply RBM assessment instruments. Key activities that contributed to this outcome have included: (i) setting up and training of 16 case study teams in the two DMCs involving over 100 education staff from various levels of government; (ii) formulation by national staff of 16 RBM case studies covering identified priorities across strategic planning processes, school budget planning, sector performance target setting, and monitoring and CD for provincial and school level performance management and monitoring.
3. *RBM road maps* have served to identify immediate and medium-term CD priorities, including measures for: (i) improved strategic planning process; (ii) better alignment between delegated authority and resource management at various levels; (iii) information technology network development; and (iv) joint sector performance review processes between Government, donors, and non-government organizations.
4. *RBM information booklet, web sites, and an exchange visit by Mongolian officials to Cambodia* have enabled broader and more diverse knowledge management on RBM between the two countries and within ADB. The translation of the RETA material into national languages and its availability on internet will facilitate greater access across stakeholders, including ministries of finance and interior/home affairs/local government. RETA progress and final reports have also contributed to wider discussions within ADB (<http://www.adb.org/projects/rbm/default.asp>) and its development partners on RBM, CD, harmonization and alignment issues. For instance, a 10-page write-up of the RETA was disseminated and discussed at the Marrakech Roundtable on Managing for Developing Results which took place in February 2004. The Mongolia work was part of a presentation in the Bishkek MfDR conference in November 2004. The visit of Mongolian education staff to Cambodia provided a further opportunity for RBM information exchange, especially about lessons learned from RBM case studies.

### **Overall Assessment and Rating**

Overall, the RETA can be rated as successful. While the majority of the RETA results were achieved, the original timetable may have been somewhat unrealistic and the extension of the RETA has allowed more time to put in place more robust knowledge management structures.

### **Major Lessons Learned**

The iterative approach, RBM case study documentation and road maps have proved useful in forward thinking on CD priorities for RBM in these sector agencies. The extensive range of knowledge management material generated under the RETA is being extensively accessed by donor partners and other stakeholders and has raised the image of ADB in promoting its RBM agenda within the region. RETA findings and lessons learned are having considerable influence on ADB lending operations in education in the two DMCs, especially related to the scope for program lending and coordinated donor support within a sector-wide approach.

### **Recommendation and Follow-Up Action**

Lessons learnt under the RETA should be carefully examined to draw conclusions for refinements of ADB's overall MfDR agenda. To ensure sustainability, the activities in Mongolia and Cambodia education sectors should be continued with a focus on dealing with MfDR issues in a decentralized context. The methodology developed under the RETA should be transferred to other sectors. A follow-up RETA, entitled Decentralization in Social Sectors, was approved in December 2004. The US\$400,000 RETA aims at (i) strengthening the MfDR orientation of social sector and local government agencies in three gradually decentralizing countries, namely, Cambodia, Indonesia, and Mongolia; and (ii) establishing mechanisms for knowledge management and exchange within and between the three countries. The new RETAs will be implemented in education and health sectors. The experience gained under the RETA should also be reflected in ADB's CD framework which is currently being developed.